



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

DRI 694 Caleb Prouty House Historic Relocation Staff Report – 2023-8-25

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 **Owner:** The Stop & Shop Supermarket Company, LLC
- 1.2 **Applicant:** Amelia Hambrecht
- 1.3 **Co-Applicant:** The Stop & Shop Supermarket Company, LLC
- 1.4 **Applicant's Agent:** Attorney Geoghan Coogan
- 1.5 **Project Locations:** 15 Cromwell Lane, Tisbury & 187 Lagoon Pond Road, Tisbury
- 1.6 **Proposal:** Temporarily remove the roof of the Caleb Prouty House, a MACRIS-listed, Greek Revival dwelling (Circa 1838), and relocate the building to a lot on Lagoon Pond Road. Per a quote of the Applicant provided by the Applicant's Agent: "I still have ConCom and ZBA left so Bob Hayden and I haven't defined it as yet but wide strokes are Bob Hayden is going to do the move (he's well known in the business and on the island; he's also doing the Macial Marine building move), we will be moving the house via lagoon pond road to my house, and up Burts Way. The roof will need to be taken off, very common in these situations according to Bob and my contractor Malcolm Boyd, but the roof will be taken off intact and put back intact so as not to change the integrity of the house. We hope to do it towards the end of September."
- 1.7 **Zoning:** B1 Commercial District & R10 Zoning District
- 1.8 **Local Permits:** Tisbury Building Department, Tisbury Conservation Commission, & Tisbury Planning Board. Possibly Tisbury Fire Department & Tisbury Police Department
- 1.9 **State Oversight/Permits:** Massachusetts Historic Commission. Possibly Massachusetts Department of Transportation & Massachusetts State Police.
- 1.10 **Surrounding Land Uses:** To the North, the Caleb Prouty House property abuts a Stop & Shop grocery store. To the East, the Caleb Prouty House property abuts a parking lot. To the South, the Caleb Prouty House property abuts the historic Claghorne Tavern building ((Circa 1789). To the West, the Caleb Prouty House property fronts Cromwell Lane
- 1.11 **Project History:** The project was referred to Commission in 2019 by the Tisbury Building Department. Prior overtures to relocate or demolish the building resulted in one or more concurrence reviews. The Prouty House presented some degree of obstacle to expansion plans previously proposed by the Stop & Shop Supermarket Company. The project was put on hold just before the start of the COVID-19 pandemic.
- 1.12 **PAL Report (& MACRIS-listing):** In 2013 Public Archeology Laboratory (PAL) evaluated the Caleb Prouty House property. The evaluation led to a PAL report, a MACRIS inventory report, and a National Register of Historic Places Criteria Statement Form. PAL described the Caleb Prouty House as built for a mariner and "an excellent local example of a moderately high-style Greek Revival style residence". PAL also remarked that Caleb Prouty House appeared to be "among the best preserved examples of its type and period in the village of Vineyard Haven and the Town of Tisbury." In consideration of a fire in 1883 that devastated significant parts of Vineyard Haven, PAL

described the Caleb Prouty House “as a rare surviving standing building in the area.” The majority of the PAL report appears incorporated into the MACRIS-listing.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 DRI Referral:** Tisbury Building Department (2019)
- 2.2 DRI Trigger:** Relocation/Alternation of a MACRIS-listed structure
- 2.3 Possible Additional Trigger:** Development within a Coastal DCPC (relocation site)
- 2.4 LUPC:** Slated August 28, 2023
- 2.5 Full Commission:** Slated September 21, 2023

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

- 3.1 Character & Identity:** Whether or not the relocation of the Caleb Prouty House from its original 19th Century location, once that survived a historic conflagration, will dilute the locational context of the dwelling and whether or not that represents a determinantal impact.
- 3.2 Impact on Abutters:** Whether or not the proposed new location for the Caleb Prouty House is near enough to abutting dwellings to be impactful.

Special Planning Concern: Has the Caleb Prouty House degraded since the PAL evaluation and if so, to what extent? If the Caleb Prouty House has degraded, is there evidence of partial demolition by neglect?