

# RE: List of open items

Philip Regan <pregan@hutkerarchitects.com>

Fri 1/21/2022 6:19 PM

To: Jeffrey Meyer <meyerjeffreys@gmail.com>; Sean Dougherty <sdougherty@hutkerarchitects.com>; Lois Meyer <loisb.meyer@gmail.com>;

Cc: Alex Elvin <elvin@mvcommission.org>;

Alex and any commissioners that are interested

Regarding the cost to construct the new house vs the cost to renovate the old is an impossible question without a great deal more detail. To date we have studied the idea of renovating the existing house, relocating a portion of the existing house (as a guest house) and designed a new house. Renovating the existing house, as a primary long term home is not feasible without a complete re-build and substantive addition(s). The building code, the energy code and our structural analysis mandate it...this will be true with many old homes moving forward.

Relocation of a portion of the existing house is a possibility and more manageable, however, it remains a re-build and it results in a second dwelling on the property that the Meyer's don't need...it also flies in the face of additional development on the property...more infrastructure, more disturbance, more everything. We are actually attempting to reduce the number of dwellings on the property from three to one.

Renovating the existing house (rebuilding it in its current location) as the primary and singular dwelling on the property is mandating that the Meyer's live as we lived in the 1800's. Outside of being in a historic district, or outside of this house being on the national register, that would be completely unfair. The existing structure, as a home, would be of interest to a select few (we are willing to offer the house, to any taker. I suspect there will be no takers due to the magnitude of the cost of the renovation project vs. the end result). Small chopped up rooms that have no connection to the landscape, limited passive ventilation and natural light, low ceilings, multiple fireplaces, no views (when possible) is a home lifestyle most of us have moved on from.

Certain amount of irony here...there is a desire to have new houses recede into the natural landscape with natural building materials and no white paint...which is our exact intent vs. a stately white painted home (a mid-1800's version of a "trophy" home) calling attention to itself.

I can supply the following:

New house as designed:

- 4600 sq. ft. x \$1,000/sq. ft. = \$4,600,000
- Selective dismantling of existing house (donate materials) = \$25,000
- Demolition/disposal of remaining materials = \$35,000 (both structures)
- Hazardous materials disposal = \$25,000

Total +/- \$4,695,000

Relocated and renovated guest house as "schematically" designed

- 1,200 sq. ft. (renovated portion of existing house) x \$700/sq. ft. = \$840,000
- 600 sq. ft. (new construction/addition) x \$700/sq. ft. = \$420,000
- Pick up and move renovated portion of existing house = \$150,000
- Demolition/disposal of remaining materials (rear portion of existing house and cottage) = \$35,000
- Hazardous materials disposal = \$25,000

Total +/- \$1,480,000

Renovated "replica" house with comparable additions

- 1200 sq. ft. (renovated portion of existing house) x \$1,100/sq. ft. = \$1,320,000...higher multiplier due to selective carpentry required.
- 3400 sq. ft. (new construction/addition) x \$1,000/sq. ft. = \$3,400,000
- Pick up of existing house for new foundation = \$50,000
- Demolition/disposal of remaining materials (rear portion of existing house and cottage) = \$35,000
- Hazardous materials disposal = \$25,000

Total +/- \$4,830,000

From a professional perspective, I cant fathom the idea of mandating the creation of a "replica" of an 1850 house. It serves no purpose in representing a point in time...as all good architecture should. A great house today, will be worth preserving tomorrow. Similar costs, between the two approaches, is irrelevant. The larger question surrounds authentic vs. reproduction.

Most everyone loves an old house (this is an old house, not an historic house...that concluded with the re-build in 1948), as long as it's on some one else's property and they are responsible for maintaining it.

Lastly, I read a letter from the previous owner's family that included photographs from the real estate listing. That is not the house I saw during my first visit which was within a month of the meyer purchase...not even close...not inside nor out.

Feel free to share with the Commissioners.

PHIL

**Phil Regan**  
Principal  
Hutker Architects, Inc.  
508.693.3344  
pregan@hutkerarchitects.com  
[www.hutkerarchitects.com](http://www.hutkerarchitects.com)

**HUTKER**  
ARCHITECTS



"A Sense of Place: Houses on Martha's Vineyard and Cape Cod" is available now.

NOTICE: This email message and all attachments transmitted with it may contain confidential information intended solely for the use of the addressee. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any reading, dissemination, distribution, copying, or other use of this message or its attachments is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately by telephone or by return email, and delete this message and all copies and backups thereof. Our systems are checked for viruses, but please note that we do not accept liability for any viruses which may be transmitted in or with the message.

---

**From:** Jeffrey Meyer <meyerjeffreys@gmail.com>

**Sent:** Friday, January 21, 2022 3:00 PM

**To:** Philip Regan <pregan@hutkerarchitects.com>; Sean Dougherty <sdougherty@hutkerarchitects.com>; Lois Meyer <loisb.meyer@gmail.com>

**Subject:** Fwd: List of open items

**CAUTION:** This email originated from outside of your organization. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender's address and trust the content to be safe.

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Alex Elvin <elvin@mvcommission.org>

**Date:** January 20, 2022 at 6:10:55 PM EST

**To:** Jeff Meyer <meyerjeffreys@gmail.com>

**Subject:** Re: List of open items

Thanks again. I can't be sure who will attend, but I encouraged everyone who is able.

Also, I was asked to inquire about the stated cost of demolishing and building new vs. renovating or relocating. Phil Regan said at the hearing that the latter would cost about 1.2-1.5 million, and that would approach the cost of demolishing and building new. Can you please provide any documentation of that assessment, or more specific figures? I'm happy to discuss anything over the phone.

Alex

Alex Elvin

Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
Martha's Vineyard Commission  
The Olde Stone Building  
33 New York Avenue  
Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
(774) 563-5363

---

**From:** Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 20, 2022 5:24 PM  
**To:** Alex Elvin  
**Subject:** Re: List of open items

Alex - we are confirmed for Tuesday at 2pm and thank you very much

Any sense of the Commissioners who are thinking of coming?

On Thu, Jan 20, 2022 at 4:46 PM Alex Elvin <[elvin@mvcommission.org](mailto:elvin@mvcommission.org)> wrote:

Great. Let's plan on Tuesday at 2. Bricque Garber is a member of the Edgartown HDC, but she has commented as a resident of West Tisbury. (Her letter to the commission today is available [here](#).)

Thanks,

Alex

Alex Elvin  
Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
Martha's Vineyard Commission  
The Olde Stone Building  
33 New York Avenue  
Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
(774) 563-5363

---

**From:** Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 20, 2022 12:52 PM  
**To:** Alex Elvin  
**Subject:** Re: List of open items

Alex -

Can you share who is coming from the Edgartown Historical Commission and what MVC Commissioners that might attend

And can we confirm Tuesday afternoon at whatever time works best for you - 2 or 3PM?

On Wed, Jan 19, 2022 at 4:10 PM Alex Elvin <[elvin@mvcommission.org](mailto:elvin@mvcommission.org)> wrote:

I can't be sure, but I know that at least one member of the public, who is also on the Edgartown Historical Commission, wanted to be included. I would say maybe 4-5 MV commissioners might attend.

Alex

Alex Elvin  
Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
Martha's Vineyard Commission  
The Olde Stone Building  
33 New York Avenue  
Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
(774) 563-5363

---

**From:** Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, January 19, 2022 1:33 PM  
**To:** Alex Elvin  
**Cc:** Lois Meyer  
**Subject:** Re: List of open items

Alex - any idea on how many and who is likely to attend?

On Wed, Jan 19, 2022 at 12:46 PM Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)> wrote:

Alex - let me check with Lois and Hutker and we will get back to you shortly

Many thanks, Jeff

On Wed, Jan 19, 2022 at 10:56 AM Alex Elvin <[elvin@mvcommission.org](mailto:elvin@mvcommission.org)> wrote:

Hi Jeff,

We would like to set up another site visit for commissioners who did not attend the last one. Could we set this up for Monday at 2? We could also do Tuesday at 2 or 3. You wouldn't all need to be there if you are off-Island, but someone from Hutker should at least be there to show people around.

Thanks,

Alex

Alex Elvin  
Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
Martha's Vineyard Commission  
The Olde Stone Building  
33 New York Avenue  
Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
(774) 563-5363

---

**From:** Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, January 18, 2022 4:08 PM  
**To:** Alex Elvin  
**Cc:** Lois Meyer  
**Subject:** Re: List of open items

Alex - thank you very much - we will read - discuss and get back to you

On Tue, Jan 18, 2022 at 3:58 PM Alex Elvin <[elvin@mvcommission.org](mailto:elvin@mvcommission.org)> wrote:

Hi Jeff and Lois,

Please see the attached list of possible offers/conditions for 371 Indian Hill Road. These are based on statements made by the applicant or West Tisbury historical commission during the MVC review. You are welcome to propose any version of these as formal offers, or to propose other offers that are not included here. The formal offers can be submitted to me in writing, and I will share with commissioners.

Also, it is possible the commission will request a second site visit, in which case that would need to happen before Jan. 27. I will try to confirm as soon as possible, but would you or someone from Hutker be available for a site visit early next week?

Thanks,

Alex

Alex Elvin  
Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
Martha's Vineyard Commission  
The Olde Stone Building  
33 New York Avenue  
Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
(774) 563-5363

---

From: Jeff Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
Sent: Monday, January 17, 2022 12:19 PM  
To: Alex Elvin

Cc: Lois Meyer  
Subject: Re: List of open items

Many thanks.

> On Jan 17, 2022, at 10:46, Alex Elvin <[elvin@mvcommission.org](mailto:elvin@mvcommission.org)> wrote:  
>  
> Hi Jeff,  
>  
> Sorry I wasn't in touch after the meeting on Thursday. I will try to get back to you tomorrow with a list of possible offers/conditions.

>  
> Alex  
>  
> Alex Elvin  
> Development of Regional Impact (DRI) Coordinator  
> Martha's Vineyard Commission  
> The Olde Stone Building  
> 33 New York Avenue  
> Oak Bluffs, MA 02557  
> (774) 563-5363

>  
>  
> \_\_\_\_\_  
> From: Jeffrey Meyer <[meyerjeffreys@gmail.com](mailto:meyerjeffreys@gmail.com)>  
> Sent: Monday, January 17, 2022 8:36 AM  
> To: Alex Elvin; Lois Meyer  
> Subject: List of open items

>  
> Alex -  
>  
> Please send us a list of the items you have regarding conditions and offers  
>  
> We will then set a time with you to discuss  
>  
> Thank you and Doug for the extension  
>  
> All the best, Jeff and Lois