



PO BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453  
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

## Minutes of the Commission Meeting Held on September 28, 2017 Oak Bluffs Town Hall School Street, Oak Bluffs, MA

### IN ATTENDANCE

---

Commissioners: (P= Present; A= Appointed; E= Elected)

- |  |                                   |
|--|-----------------------------------|
| P Gail Barmakian (A-Oak Bluffs)          | - Michael Kim (A-Governor)        |
| P Tripp Barnes (E-Tisbury)               | P Joan Malkin (A-Chilmark)        |
| P Christina Brown (E-Edgartown)          | P Katherine Newman (A-Aquinnah)   |
| - Peter Connell (A-Governor; non-voting) | P Ben Robinson (A-Tisbury)        |
| - Robert Doyle (E-Chilmark)              | - Doug Sederholm (E-West Tisbury) |
| - Josh Goldstein (E-Tisbury)             | P Linda Sibley (E-West Tisbury)   |
| P Fred Hancock (E-Oak Bluffs)            | P Ernie Thomas (A-West Tisbury)   |
| - Leonard Jason (A-County)               | P Richard Toole (E-Oak Bluffs)    |
| - James Joyce (A-Edgartown)              | P James Vercruysse (E-Aquinnah)   |

Staff: Adam Turner (Executive Director), Bill Veno (Senior Planner), Paul Foley (DRI Planner), Christine Flynn (Economic Development and Affordable Housing Planner), Dan Doyle (Transportation Planner).

**Chairman James Vercruysse** called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

### 1. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR REPORT

---

Commissioners Present: G. Barmakian, T. Barnes, C. Brown, F. Hancock, J. Malkin, K. Newman, B. Robinson, L. Sibley, E. Thomas, R. Toole, J. Vercruysse.

**Adam Turner** presented the following:

- He met with the Hospital CEO to talk about Wildflower Court, and how the changes would relate to the DRI decision.
- The CEO agreed that any changes would need to be vetted by the MVC, but the hospital has not yet made decisions on what the changes would be, other than the services will stop. The decision for the future of the space would likely be made after the new CEO has been selected, in approximately December 2017.
- There was a discussion about affordable housing for hospital staff.
- The hospital needs more space for their new model, and it should be addressed by the MVC.
- MVC staff has been active on the herbicide use issue. The Eversource notices are very general about the locations and times the spraying will occur. Today, a call was received from Eversource, and we want to be very positive with them.
  - **Gail Barmakian** asked if abutters would be notified if Eversource insists on going forward with the spraying. She felt that the topic needs to be addressed.
  - **Adam Turner** felt that the abutters probably wouldn't be notified, but that he would ask.

## **2. DRI 678 OAK BLUFFS TOWN HALL RECONSTRUCTION PUBLIC HEARING**

---

*Commissioners Present:* G. Barmakian, T. Barnes, C. Brown, F. Hancock, J. Malkin, K. Newman, B. Robinson, L. Sibley, E. Thomas, R. Toole, J. Vercruysse.

*For the Applicant:* Bill McGrath (Town of Oak Bluffs Building Committee), John Lolley (Project Engineer), Joe Sullivan (Project Manager).

**Linda Sibley**, Public Hearing Officer, opened the Public Hearing at 6:05 p.m. and read the Public Hearing Notice. The applicant is the Town of Oak Bluffs and the location of the project is a 2.02 acre parcel, 56 School Street, Oak Bluffs Town Hall, Map 11 Lot 292. The proposal is to demolish the existing Town Hall and to construct a new three-story 21,100 gsf Town Hall with a partial basement on the same site. The proposal also includes a temporary Town Hall across the street in three double wide trailers. The public hearing process was reviewed.

### **2.1 Staff Report**

**Paul Foley** presented the following:

- The proposal is to demolish the existing two-story Town Hall and construct a new three-story 21,100 gsf Town Hall with a partial basement on the same site. The proposal also includes a temporary Town Hall across the street on Graham & Gabriel Avenues with three double wide trailers.
- The ridge height is four feet higher than the existing.
- Until the year 2000, the Oak Bluffs Town Hall was downtown in what is now the Police Station. The building was declared "sick," so the town offices were moved to the old Oak Bluffs School, which was abandoned in 1998. This move was intended to be temporary.
- There was a fire in 1948, and at some point in the 1960's the old school was demolished and rebuilt. The existing Town Hall is not historically significant, is not up to the State building and fire safety codes, and is not ADA compliant.
- Town Meeting approved funding for the project.
- The site was reviewed.
- The existing building has two levels with a footprint of 6,740 sf, a total of 18,160 sf of finished space, and a partial basement of 2,800 sf, for a total of approximately 20,960 gsf.
- The proposal includes a 60 seat capacity meeting/multipurpose room on the main level (off Pacific Ave.)
- The lower level would be accessed from the back and would have the Building and Planning Board, Board of Health, Conservation Commission, the Town Clerk, a shared meeting room and storage. The main level would include Accounting, Assessor, Tax Office and Collector, and the Treasurer with a three story lobby. An upper level would have the offices for the Town Administrator, Assistant Town Administrator, Board of Selectmen and Planning Board, plus a large conference room, and approximately 650 sf of future space. An elevator would provide access to all levels of the new building.
- The site is challenged with a grade change and the building has been designed around that. The elevation is 41 ft at the NW corner and slopes to 31 ft at the SE corner of the new building. The low point of the property is 27 ft at the SE corner of the library parking.
- The revised landscape plan was submitted this week, and the new drainage plan will be submitted tonight. The MVC staff has not reviewed that information yet.
- The proposal also includes a temporary Town Hall across the street in three double wide trailers.
- A site visit was conducted.



- Key issues include:
  - Drainage: The plan adds a significant amount of impervious surfaces to the small site at the top of a street that already has flooding issues.
  - Parking: The plan includes 11 diagonal parking spaces on School Street, which would require backing into the School Street travel lane near the traffic exiting the new parking lot and cars entering from Pacific Avenue.
  - Pedestrian/Bicycle Access: Pedestrian access is geared to the building, not to the street.
  - Construction Schedule: Where would building materials and equipment be stored during construction? How would noise, dust and traffic be mitigated during the construction process in order to minimize possible impacts to the surrounding Town Library and residents?
  - Temporary Town Hall Trailers: Detailed plans for the trailers have not been reviewed. There could be some drainage issues where the trailers are proposed to be sited.
- Two street trees (Maples) on School Street would be removed and replaced with one Red Maple on the corner, and three Red Maples between the building and the new diagonal parking on School Street. The northwest corner of the building would be planted with Hydrangeas. The rear of the building facing the Library parking lot would be planted with Hydrangeas, Viburnum and Red Maple. A total of eight Red Maples would be planted on the site.
- The planting plan was shown and the plant list was reviewed.
- The plan adds a significant amount of impervious surfaces to the small site at the top of a street that already has flooding issues. The site is currently approximately 40% impervious surface. There are current issues with drainage, and stormwater being directed into the street. The low point of the Town Hall and Library property is in the southeast corner of the site. Stormwater appears to spill off the site in the southeast corner during heavy storm events.
- The existing site plan was reviewed, and the proposed site and plan were reviewed.
- The vehicular traffic pattern was reviewed. School Street would be expanded by five feet.
- Potential new vehicular circulation conflicts:
  - The 11 diagonal parking spaces on School Street require backing into the travel lane.
  - The top spots are close to traffic exiting the new parking lot.
  - As these spots descend down the street, smaller cars would have more difficulty seeing if cars are coming down School Street as they back into the travel lane.
  - Cars exiting the new parking lot turning right onto Pacific Avenue do not have room.
- There is an existing sight line problem on the street with cars driving up School Street. At the corner of Pacific Avenue, there are perpendicular spots in front of the Catholic parish hall that block the view of cars driving up School Street.
- A sidewalk should be considered along Pacific Avenue to improve pedestrian connectivity.
- The MVC does not apply the Affordable Housing Policy to municipal projects.
- The new Town Hall is estimated to cost \$9,880,753. The funding was approved at Annual Town Meeting and by ballot in April 2017.
- There are approximately 20 employees, not including volunteers, at the current Town Hall. The hours of operation are Monday-Friday, 8:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m. It is not anticipated that the number of employees or hours would change.
- Proposed elevations and floor plans were reviewed, as well as the proposed Town Hall site plan.
- A photo tour of the site was presented.
- Existing and proposed drainage patterns were reviewed. Downspouts would be directed to subsurface tanks.

- The site plan for the temporary trailers was reviewed. Trailers would be rented and there would be swaddles for drainage. The proposed floor plan was reviewed. The parking area was indicated on the site photos.

## **2.2 Applicants' Presentation**

**Bill McGrath** presented the following:

- The current site photos and the proposed plan were shown.
- A photo of the original school was shown; the foundation is still on site. A later version of the school was shown from the turn of the century. The roof line was changed from the original.
- The Oak Bluffs School was built in 1965 on the same site, and historical photos were shown, noting that the Town Hall part was to the left and behind.
- The site photos were shown from 2000, 2004 and 2005.
- The temporary Town Hall plans were reviewed.
- A photo of a typical trailer was reviewed and shown, but it was noted that it would not be a true example of what it would be.
- The new landscape plan was shown with angled parking, and the catch basins were indicated.
- Site plan, planting plan and floor plans were shown. Perspectives were shown from all directions.

**John Lolley** presented the following:

- The drainage plan was reviewed.
- The ridge of the building was shown, and where the runoff would flow was indicated.
- The runoff on the street side would be towards the street, and would run through underground pipes into four catch basins, so puddles would not collect on the grasses. The concept was to get water underground to prevent freezing on the surface in colder weather.
- The soil is very permeable and water flows through it quickly.
- The areas that are not being revised for drainage were indicated on the drainage plan. The drainage and topography would remain as it is now.

## **2.3 Commissioners' Questions**

There was a discussion about drainage.

- **Fred Hancock** asked if there was additional drainage in the diagonal parking area on School Street.
- **John Lolley** showed where the water would flow and collect to go through the catch basin. The water would not runoff into the road.
- **Joan Malkin** asked if the catch basin grates would pose a problem for retaining debris.
- **John Lolley** said there is a grate and there is a basin. Water fills the pipe and drains into a vault. The catch basin would be cleaned regularly.
- **Joan Malkin** said that Paul Foley had mentioned that the street runoff down School Street can be significant. Would widening the road exasperate that issue?
- **Bill McGrath** said the road crowns towards the catch basin and the basin should catch the runoff.
- **Gail Barmakian** asked if there was an equation to determine how much extra runoff would be created, and asked if the proposed catch basins could maintain that.
- **Bill McGrath** said the plan was designed for a 25 year storm.

There was a discussion about traffic.

- **Linda Sibley** said Paul Foley addressed parking. Would this new building draw any new traffic?
- **Bill McGrath** said it would not. The Town Hall would have the same number of employees.



- **Paul Foley** said the proposal is not expected to be a huge increase in trip generation, but the increased meeting space could generate more traffic.
- **Bill McGrath** noted that there were events at the Library and at the Town Hall tonight, which could be viewed as a current example of a high traffic volume occurrence.
- **Gail Barmakian** said there might be one extra event twice a year, and the Library provides for extra use.
- **Bill McGrath** added that overflow parking could be at the church for special events.
- **Adam Turner** said there would be two meetings at the Town Hall and at the Library, and the capacity is getting larger.
- **Bill McGrath** said the proposed project has increased parking by 11 to 12 parking spaces.
- **Katherine Newman** asked if the applicant could work on the traffic circulation with regards to people backing out into the road, and perhaps into other cars.
- **Bill McGrath** showed the site photo and indicated the traffic circulation. The Road and Byways Committee plans to extend the sidewalk to the end of the cars, and add a stop sign at that point.

**Christina Brown** said there would be no increase in the number of offices or staff, but there would be an increase of 6,000 sf, so she assumed the space is currently cramped. She asked if the plan includes provisions for future growth. **Joe Sullivan** said that every building is built for 50 years. The applicants allowed for future build out in the design of the space.

There was a discussion about widening School Street.

- **Gail Barmakian** said School Street is quite narrow, and asked if the whole street would be widened. She questioned if the additional parking would be worth the tradeoff for widening the street.
- **Bill McGrath** said the added parking would get an additional 11 cars off the street. Most cars would turn around in the Library, as they do now. The intention was to force traffic in the direction of the Town Hall, and not into the wetland area of School Street.
- **Ben Robinson** thought the expansion of School Street made sense. He asked where the crosswalk would be located.
- **Bill McGrath** showed the location on the site plan. There was a sidewalk on the north side of School Street and a crosswalk to connect.

**Joan Malkin** said she always walks down the middle of the access and suggested a designated walkway for pedestrian access. She had asked on the site visit about bicycle parking, and felt that what was proposed does not seem adequate or useable. **Bill McGrath** showed the location of the bicycle racks on the site plan. There would be space for 18 bikes, and another location outside the Town Clerk office for 18 bikes. There are currently 4 bike spaces.

There was a discussion about the exterior and interior materials.

- **Ben Robinson** said he read the applicant's sustainability report and was concerned about the exterior and interior materials. He noticed that the trim would be synthetic, and there was a lot of vinyl material proposed for the interior. He questioned the use of vinyl for environmental issues.
- **Linda Sibley** said there was recently a similar discussion at the MVC, and Ben Robinson provided some interesting information.
- **John Keenan** said the exterior trim would be P5, a pressure treated wood product that is pre-primed. They are moving away from Azek. All of the products are 80% recycled, and he will provide the specifications.
- **Linda Sibley** suggested that Ben Robinson have a discussion with the design team regarding these materials.

## 2.4 Testimony from Public Officials

**Greg Coogan** is a member of the Oak Bluffs Board of Selectmen, and is also speaking for himself. He is here tonight to support the project. The Town Hall Building Committee has worked very hard on this and it was voted for at Town Meeting with overwhelming support. The Planning Board has done a lot of work over the last year to solicit Town opinion. 20 years ago, he was part of the School Committee and it was suggested then to do what is being proposed now. It is time for this project to move forward. He asked the MVC to please keep that in mind when making the decision. He was also asked to mention that the "new" school is no longer the new school; it is 23 years old.

## 2.5 Commissioners' Discussion

**Fred Hancock** asked what would happen with drainage and the topography at the SW corner of the Library. **John Lolley** said there is a slope, and the water coming down the slope will go to a water collection bunker. There will be an access way from Pacific Avenue to the Library without going through Town Hall.

There was a discussion about energy efficiency.

- **James Vercruysse** asked if the applicant could provide the MVC with a rundown of energy consumption, old versus new, for the project and asked if there was there any consideration for solar.
- **Bill McGrath** said the south facing roof would have a solar array, to be installed after the building is built. The applicants would have better pricing and more grant money available after the building is built.
- **Joe Sullivan** said there would be provisions in the building to install solar.
- **Fred Hancock** asked if a heat pump would be used initially.
- **Bill McGrath** said the building would be all electric.
- **John Keenan** said with the solar panels, the electricity would go to the grid and produce enough electricity to equal the use of the building. All exhaust air would be taken through an energy recovery system. Everything will be a state of the art system.
- **Gail Barmakian** asked if an energy audit could be conducted.
- **Joe Sullivan** said any building that is larger will use more energy, but the efficiency makes the difference. The project is modeled to indicate the efficiency, and calculations could be done at some point. Typically they are done for the owner so they can forecast 3-4 years.
- **Linda Sibley** said her plan was to keep the public record open for two weeks, and asked if the forecast could be available that quickly.
- **Joe Sullivan** said not that quickly.
- **John Keenan** said the Oak Bluffs Fire Station has a similar system. It was run through Cape Light Compact, and they gave the Town \$65,000.
- **Joan Malkin** asked if the MVC needed the energy audit to make a decision.
- **Linda Sibley** said no.
- **John Keenan** said what we have now is a typical office building and what we would spend per square foot but it is not empirical.
- **Christina Brown** said she would like more information regarding energy use and savings information. Does this system allow the windows to open?
- **Joe Sullivan** said there is capacity for it. There would be an energy management system included with the building. If the Facilities Department decides to use it, that is up to them.
- **Trip Barnes** asked if the windows would open.
- **John Keenan** said each room would be individually controlled.
- **Katherine Newman** said it would be helpful for Benefits and Detriments to have a philosophical plan if the actual plan cannot be obtained regarding the energy.



- **Linda Sibley** said the information regarding their intention was included in the narrative.
- **John Keenan** said the projection is made on how much energy is used for a standard office building versus the proposed.
- **Joe Sullivan** said they could provide that to the MVC.

**Christina Brown** asked about the plan that went to Town Meeting and what was voted on. **Bill McGrath** said in 2014, the proposal to build a new Town Hall on this site went to Town Meeting and was defeated at the ballot. In 2017, the proposal went to Town Meeting with this site and design, and it passed overwhelming at Town Meeting and also at ballot. **Steve Auerbach** is also a member of the Building Committee and added that in 2014, the new Fire House was also on the ballot and passed, which was probably why the Town Hall failed at that time.

**Fred Hancock** asked the applicant to clarify the need for the vault for the Town Clerk. **Joe Sullivan** said the vault required for the Town Clerk has to be a 6 hour rated vault. The current vault will be added to house the records, as required by the State.

**Linda Sibley**, Public Hearing Officer, suggested closing the public hearing. The applicant is in a hurry and she asked the Commissioners if it would be possible to have the post-public hearing LUPC on October 10, 2017, noting that there appeared to be enough Commissioners available on that date. She suggested keeping the written record open until October 10, 2017 at 5:00 p.m.

**Ben Robinson** said is it worth keeping the written record open. He also wants enough time to confer with the design team about materials.

**Linda Sibley** said that information would come to the LUPC, and there cannot be an LUPC meeting with an open written record. The record can be re-opened if needed. There needs to be enough time for staff to review, and for the applicants to work with staff for offers. The MVC holds the post-public hearing LUPC to make a recommendation.

**Fred Hancock** noted what information the MVC still needs: Stair access from Pacific Avenue to the parking lot; the marked area for the crosswalk/sidewalk suggestion; Ben Robinson's design consultation; the document regarding energy; and any questions from MVC staff.

**Adam Turner** said staff would review the new materials and may have some questions.

**Linda Sibley** said the applicants should expect a dialogue between themselves and staff.

**Christina Brown** asked if the written record is also open to Town Boards. **Linda Sibley** and **Adam Turner** said it is open to anyone.

**Linda Sibley**, Public Hearing Officer, closed the Public Hearing and left the written record open until 5:00 p.m. on October 10, 2017.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:25 p.m.

#### DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO DURING THE MEETING

- Martha's Vineyard Commission DRI #678 – O.B. Tow Hall Reconstruction MVC Staff Report 2018-09-28
- Plans and Elevations Town of Oaks Bluffs Proposed Town Hall, Dated March 2, 2017

317 Jan R-L  
318 Chairman  
319

11-16-17  
Date

320 [Signature]  
321 Clerk-Treasurer  
322

11/16/17  
Date