



PO BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453  
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

## Minutes of the Commission Meeting Held on September 14, 2017 At the Edgartown Library Edgartown, MA

### IN ATTENDANCE

---

Commissioners: (P= Present; A= Appointed; E= Elected)

- |  |                                   |
|--|-----------------------------------|
| - Gail Barmakian (A-Oak Bluffs)          | - Michael Kim (A-Governor)        |
| P Trip Barnes (E-Tisbury)                | P Joan Malkin (A-Chilmark)        |
| P Christina Brown (E-Edgartown)          | P Katherine Newman (A-Aquinnah)   |
| - Peter Connell (A-Governor; non-voting) | P Ben Robinson (A-Tisbury)        |
| P Robert Doyle (E-Chilmark)              | P Doug Sederholm (E-West Tisbury) |
| P Josh Goldstein (E-Tisbury)             | - Linda Sibley (E-West Tisbury)   |
| P Fred Hancock (E-Oak Bluffs)            | P Ernie Thomas (A-West Tisbury)   |
| P Leonard Jason (A-County)               | P Richard Toole (E-Oak Bluffs)    |
| P James Joyce (A-Edgartown)              | P James Vercruysse (E-Aquinnah)   |

Staff: Adam Turner (Executive Director), Bill Veno (Senior Planner), Paul Foley (DRI Planner), Mike Mauro (Senior Transportation Planner), Dan Doyle (Transportation Planner).

**Chairman James Vercruysse** called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

**James Vercruysse**, Chairman, thanked the Edgartown Library staff for use of the space, and the Edgartown Planning Board and the Board of Selectmen for their hard work up to this meeting, and the MVC staff for their hard work on the project over the past year.

### 1. DRI #429-M2 EDGARTOWN STOP & SHOP EXPANSION

---

Commissioners Present: T. Barnes, C. Brown, R. Doyle, J. Goldstein, F. Hancock, L. Jason, J. Joyce, J. Malkin, K. Newman, B. Robinson, D. Sederholm, E. Thomas, R. Toole, J. Vercruysse.

For the Applicant: Geoghan Coogan (Attorney), David Taglianetti (VHB, Managing Director of Land Development), Randy Hart (VHB-Principal), Lisa Davis (Project Manager).

**James Vercruysse**, Public hearing Officer, opened the Public Hearing at 6:00 p.m. and read the Public Hearing Notice. The applicant is WJG Realty Trust, Stop & Shop, a subsidiary of Ahold USA. The location is 245 Upper Main Street, Edgartown Map 20A Lots 15.11, 15.12, 57.1, 57.2, 57.3, 58, 59, 87.1 and 87.2. The proposal is for the construction of approximately 17,432 sf of additions to the existing 25,259 sf main Stop & Shop Supermarket building, plus the demolition and reconstruction of a slightly larger Rockland Trust Bank building, and significant site work.

#### 1.1 Staff Report

**Paul Foley** presented the following:

- A list of all of the documents for the proposal on the MVC website, as well as those to be added. The Traffic Study is not yet on the website.

- The proposal is for the construction of approximately 17,432 sf of additions to the existing 25,259 sf main Stop & Shop Supermarket building, plus the demolition and reconstruction of a slightly larger Rockland Trust Bank building, and significant site work.
- The largest addition is a 15,592 sf addition to the north side of the existing store.
- There would also be an 800 sf addition on the back of the existing loading dock and a 1,040 sf canopy addition attached to that, resulting in a 1,840 sf addition in the back of the store.
- The proposed additions to the grocery store building amount to 17,432 sf (15,592 sf + 1,840 sf), an increase of 69% to the existing 24,259 sf one-story building, for a total building footprint of the main grocery store of 42,691 gsf.
- The existing Edgartown National/Rockland Trust Bank driveway would be closed; the existing Stop & Shop driveway (west) would be relocated approximately 65 ft to the west to align directly with Pinehurst Road; and the existing Stop & Shop driveway (east) would remain the same.
- The proposed layout was reviewed: the existing buildings vs. the proposed, the existing pavement and permeable surfaces with the new paving, and the proposed filtration systems.
- The site was reviewed: the aerial view of the site, the proposal overlaid over the existing buildings, and the vegetative areas that are proposed to be paved.
- Key Issues include:
  - Traffic: Can the road network handle the estimated 48% increase in peak hour, peak season trip generation accounted for by this site with the expansion? This equates to approximately four cars (two in and two out) per minute more than the existing conditions.
  - Parking: What is the appropriate amount of parking for this proposal?
  - Drainage:
    - The site has a major drainage problem in the front of the store. The store sits at the bottom of a slope with a sheet flow from the parking lot overwhelming the existing infiltration basins.
    - The current proposal removes a significant amount of vegetated area at the low point of the site, and proposes handling stormwater entirely through engineered catch basins.
    - Should the applicant retain more contiguous open space with which to handle the drainage through more natural means?
  - Noise:
    - Have the applicants adequately addressed the noise issues?
    - The applicants have proposed a 12 ft high sound attenuating fence along the rear of the property, and a sound attenuating fence on top of the building surrounding the mechanicals.
    - However, the expansion will cause new noise issues for the residential abutters on the northern side where the new loading docks are planned close to the rear of the property, bringing the noise of idling trucks and the beeping of backing up close to their houses.
  - Housing: Are the applicants adequately addressing the housing needs associated with their operation and this expansion?
  - Sustainability: Have the applicants adequately addressed issues related to Green Building Design, the environment, and energy sustainability?
  - Aesthetics: Do the existing building and the expansion fit the character of Upper Main Street?



- Intensity of Use: The proposal includes a 69% increase in building footprint and significant site work that will virtually cover the entire site, and the store will now also contain a pharmacy, a florist, and other specialty items. Is this intensity of use too much for one location?
  - Impact: How will this project impact and potentially benefit the surrounding businesses within the Upper Main Street Business District and the Island?
  - Consistency with Plans: Is this project consistent with local or regional plans, such as the MVC's Island Plan or Edgartown's B-II Master Plan?
  - Construction Schedule: Where will all building materials and equipment be stored during construction?
  - Construction: How will noise, dust, and traffic be mitigated during the construction process to minimize possible impacts to the surrounding businesses and residents?
- In the northern corner of the lot, approximately  $\frac{1}{6}$  to  $\frac{1}{5}$  of the total area is wooded. The wooded area is mostly Quaking Aspen, Russian Olive, and other volunteer successor species that have matured over time.
- The trees between the parking in front of the building are various types of oak trees. Many of these trees are suffering from small, silted-over tree grates that do not allow nutrients and water to reach the roots. Trees attached to the larger planted islands are doing better. Photos were reviewed of the existing trees.
- Along the front of the property in the MassDOT right of way, a variety of apple and cherry trees sit under the telephone wires. A few have grown to the height of the wires, but most have not. The applicant has a temporary easement from 1993, but will need to go to the State for any proposed work in this area.
- A mature landscaped area of honey locust and maple surrounding the existing bank are proposed to be removed for parking and traffic flow.
- The plant schedule was reviewed.
- Site visit photos of the vegetation were reviewed.
- Site visit photos were reviewed of the building location: the corner of the new bank building which will be moved forward; a flag indicating the edge of the pavement that is currently wooded; the residential neighbors in perspective to the new building; and the new curb cut to be aligned with Pinehurst Road.
- During the site visit, there were three trucks and two back ends of trucks, as well as several storage containers on the property, and it was loud in the area with the trucks idling.
- Stormwater: A large area of runoff is directed to a 1,300 sf infiltration leaching system.
  - There is a major drainage problem in front of the store. The store sits at the bottom of a slope with sheet flow from the parking lot overwhelming the existing infiltration basin directly in front of the store.
  - The proposal accounts for roof and parking lot stormwater runoff to be directed to three of the four existing infiltration systems: 6,480 sf to a new large infiltration tank under the new parking area on the north of the site that is 8,700 sf. The new total infiltration leaching area will be 15,180 sf.
  - The current proposal involves a significant increase in the impervious surfaces. MVC Staff estimated the impervious surfaces of the site would increase from approximately 60-65% to approximately 82% under the project as proposed.
  - Site visit photos of the existing drainage issues were reviewed.
- The proposal reduces the total curb cuts on the site from three to two.
- The proposed site plan includes 178 proposed parking spots: 178 is an increase of 10.5% over the existing 161 spots, an increase of 77% over the average observed peak season use (101



spaces), an increase of 49% over the maximum peak season use (120 spaces), and is 40% more spots than required by zoning. Under zoning, this proposal would require 127 parking spots for vehicles.

- Zoning requires 60 bicycle spaces for a development of this scale. Currently, there are roughly 15 spaces for bikes, and the applicant proposes 27 spaces for bikes.
- Trip Generation (based on ITE):
  - Currently Stop & Shop generates 430 trips during August weekday evening peak hours.
  - ITE trip generation rates were applied to the proposal to generate an estimate of 207 additional trips expected to occur during weekday PM peak hour (637 total).
  - The additional 207 peak hour trips would be about a 48% increase in the peak hour trips for the existing estimated 430 peak hour trips.
  - Currently 28% of the traffic on Upper Main Street enters or exits the Stop & Shop site during the August weekday peak evening hour (4:30-5:30 p.m.).
  - The total volume on Upper Main Street is estimated to rise from 1,545 to 1,752 vehicles.
  - With the proposed expansion, Stop & Shop is estimated to account for 37% (637 vehicles out of 1,752) of the total trips on Upper Main Street during the August weekday peak evening hour.
- In terms of overall traffic operations, the results of the study indicate that the proposal could increase their peak season peak hour trip generation by 48%, and would account for 37% of the total volume on Upper Main Street.
- Reducing the curb cuts and aligning the entry/exit with Pinehurst Road will reduce conflict points. Two entries to the store should reduce circling trips within the parking lot.
- The applicant should improve pedestrian connections within the site.
- According to the MVC Affordable Housing Policy, the recommended monetary mitigation is \$26,670 for a project with 17,835 total sf (of the additions). The applicant has not submitted an Affordable Housing Offer at this time.
- Staff recommended the following regarding affordable housing: the current provision of year-round and seasonal workforce housing be continued. In the anticipation of 25-35 new employees, new workforce housing should also be provided, with established mechanisms for monitoring by the DCRHA and reporting to the MVC for the life of the project.
- The applicant submitted employment and housing data today (September 14, 2017), and staff is currently evaluating the information.
- The applicant has not submitted a final set of numbers outlining a range of year-round and seasonal employees, as well as those employees with health or union benefits at this time.
- Potential impacts to municipal services:
  - Impacts to Police and Fire Services are likely to be minimal since the proposed project is located within a densely developed commercial/residential area.
  - The impact on Fire Services should be positive because all new commercial construction will have fire safety and code compliance.
  - It is not anticipated that there will be any impact to schools.
  - The applicant is tied into town water and sewer at the applicant's expense.
- The proposal includes removing and replacing many trees along Upper Main Street that will make the buildings more visible from the street until the trees mature.
- The additions are approximately a 70% increase to an already large (25,592 sf) building. The massing is similar to the existing building. A guide to building large buildings on Cape Cod recommends breaking up large buildings to look like several smaller buildings.
- The architecture is similar to the existing building, with some updating.
- The building will be A.D.A. compliant.

- Perspectives of the new building were reviewed, and showed some improvement in pedestrian connection to the parking area.
- Existing elevations vs. proposed elevations shows a significant expansion. Site sections were reviewed.

**James Joyce** asked if there was any additional information about the bank. **Paul Foley** said it is currently 600 sf, and will be going to 1,010 sf. He will add images to the MVC website.

**Paul Foley** said that the LUPC approved a traffic scope in March, and a turning lane on Upper Main Street was not analyzed. There were 12 truck deliveries per day and in peak season, and four to five trucks parked per day.

**Richard Toole** asked for information regarding the pharmacy. **Paul Foley** said the pharmacy is currently at the Triangle, and will be relocated inside the store. A florist will also be incorporated into the new store.

### **1.2 Applicants' Presentation**

**Geoghan Coogan** presented the following:

- He thanked the MVC and the Edgartown Planning Board who have spent a lot of time with the Stop & Shop team going over details of the plan in advance.
- The applicant is not building the typical prototype Stop & Shop building.
- There are two goals for the design and the plan: to bring a real, updated grocery store to the Island and to Edgartown, and to fit it to the current space.
- The applicant is proposing to bring a better store to Edgartown. It will be bigger and have more products and selection with larger aisles.
- The applicant is trying to alleviate the current crowding and congestion. It will be a larger, more functional grocery store.
- A lot of trees are being removed, but rain gardens will be added.
- There are unique features of the store to fit into the Town of Edgartown.
- The Island and Edgartown have outgrown the current store. It has to be enlarged. The vision is to make it better than what exists.

**Lisa Davis** presented the following:

- She is the Planner and Project Manager, and members of the team include: Chuck Sullivan and Thomas Scott, Architects; Samira Ahmadi, LEED Engineer; and Greg O'Brien, Community Outreach Consultant.
- Permitting Process:
  - Submitted for a Special Permit from the Edgartown Planning Board.
  - There was a Public Hearing for the Special Permit.
  - The project was referred to the MVC.
  - The applicant team met with the LUPC.
  - The MVC Public Hearing is being held.
  - There will be a continued Special Permit Public Hearing through the Edgartown Planning Board, and a decision.
  - Board of Health, water and sewer, and building permits are needed.
- Paul Foley did a good job of the project overview for this expansion.
- The store will remain open during construction.
- Construction is scheduled to begin in the Fall of 2018.
- The existing store fixture plan was shown.



- Issues regarding the existing store include that it was built in 1965 as an A&P. Stop & Shop purchased the store in 2004-2005, and did some upgrading. Regardless of the updates, the store was built in 1965. There is a lack of storage, and not enough shelf space. There are narrow aisles, and there is no connection from the main store to the seasonal store. There are not enough registers, and no internal storage for shopping carts. The store is not energy efficient, and the restrooms are tired.
- The proposed fixture plan was shown. It would be a new renovated store for a new shopping experience.
- The new store would have the following: a new and expanded main entrance, expanded checkout lanes, customer seating (especially to accommodate the elderly), a new pharmacy, new food preparation areas that are needed at the request of the Board of Health, expanded aisles, expanded receiving area and storage, and expanded produce, natural foods and deli departments.
- The existing departments would be expanded and also include a florist, and internal storage for 44 shopping carts. The sales area would increase; the current store has 69% sales area, the proposal would have 76% of the store as sales area.
- Employment Statistics:
  - Average non-seasonal year-round employment is 75 associates.
  - Summer/seasonal help adds 75-100 associates.
  - Year-round, there are 25-35 full-time associates.
  - The expanded store is adding 5-10 new year-round and 15-25 summer associates, mostly part-time.
  - Stop & Shop associates are full-time and part-time, and are members of the United Food and Commercial Workers Union - Local 328.
  - Associate wages, health and other benefits are set forth in the union contract.
- Workforce Housing:
  - In 2017, Stop & Shop provided housing for 120 associates on the Island.
  - 75 beds are dedicated to Edgartown employees.
  - In 2018, the goal is to provide 130-140 beds.
  - In 2018, the annual budget for housing on Martha's Vineyard will be \$800,000-\$1,000,000.
  - Stop & Shop reviews housing annually.
  - Stop & Shop understands that provided housing is an integral part of attracting qualified associates.
  - Stop & Shop is willing to make an annual contribution to Dukes County Housing Authority, and if Stop & Shop provides housing, this contribution would be reduced.
- Community Outreach:
  - Lisa Davis and Greg O'Brien met with the neighbors on Cyprian Way and Curtis Lane.
  - The Stop & Shop team has met with the Chamber of Commerce and the Edgartown Board of Trade.
  - Greg O'Brien collected 700 Edgartown customer signatures supporting the project.

**David Taglianetti** presented the following:

- The existing and the proposed site plans were compared, including the parking, site layout, pedestrian connectivity, lighting, landscaping, grading, stormwater, utilities, and a property mitigation plan.
- There would be improved vehicular access/egress from Upper Main Street. The existing site has three points of egress on Upper Main Street, which would be reduced to two. The western driveway would be aligned with Pinehurst Road, and this would also reduce conflict points.

- There would be improved on-site circulation with an additional entry to the store, and a larger, better utilized parking lot to the west of the store.
- The bank relocation would have the drive-thru in front, and vehicles can queue outside the existing travel paths.
- Rain gardens are included in the proposal.
- 168 parking spaces would be provided. Currently, there are 139 spaces.
- The additional parking is required to support the increase in vehicle trips and customers, additional employees, and provide a lower turnover rate. The additional parking would decrease the need to circle the parking field for prime spaces and decrease pedestrian conflicts.
- Truck loading circulation is to be improved. The existing and the proposed truck routes were shown on the site layout plan.
- Shopping cart storage would be increased, with total storage for 194 carts inside and outside; 44 carts inside, and the corals can hold 90 carts.
- Snow storage areas were shown on the site plan.
- Pedestrian Connectivity Plan:
  - The proposal includes 25 bike spaces, where currently there are 18 spaces. On average, six or seven spaces are used at any given time, so it was felt that 25 bike spaces would be sufficient. Paul Foley mentioned that zoning would require 60 spaces based on the number of vehicle parking spaces (1 bike space for every 3 vehicle spaces), but the Stop & Shop team felt that 60 bike spaces was excessive.
  - Improved pedestrian/cyclist connectivity from Upper Main Street.
  - Improved pedestrian access to the front parking area.
- Landscaping:
  - A comprehensive landscape plan was provided, and all proposed plants are on the Martha's Vineyard approved plant list.
  - 33 trees would be planted: 13 replacement trees, 20 new Red Maples, Pin Oaks, Zelkouvass and Crab Apples.
  - There would be 429 shrubs: Inkberry, Rhododendron, Yew, Viburnum.
  - Ground cover would be ornamental grasses and perennials.
  - The landscaping within the existing side parking field is to be maintained.
  - Six trees within the front parking field would be replaced.
  - Existing shrubs and perennials would be replaced as needed.
  - The current oak trees would be replaced with Pin Oaks, which will do better.
  - The trees on Upper Main Street are predominately cherry trees, and are overgrown into wires, which requires trimming, and do not look good. They will be replaced with Crab Apple trees, which will grow shorter with a wider span that will fit the constraints of the area.
- The same character for lighting and the lighting levels would be maintained. The light poles and fixture details have been provided. A photometric plan was presented showing one to four foot candles throughout the parking area, and less than or equal to one foot candles along the side and rear property lines.
- The grading was designed to minimize land impacts. There were existing design constraints, such as the grade of Upper Main Street at the edge of the pavement. The grades would be met at the edge of the pavement. The maximum slope would be 5-6% at the site drive; and the maximum slope within the parking of 2-3% with a minimum slope of 1%. The proposed grade at the back is elevation 16 that would be matched to the existing grade.
- Stormwater Management:
  - There is existing ponding at the front of the store.



- The existing stormwater system would be maintained.
  - The proposed drainage system includes a closed collection system with a series of catch basins, drainage manholes, and water gates. It will accommodate a 100-year storm event and meets DEP regulations.
  - There is a subsurface infiltration system, which is a series of underground pipes that create volume for the water to be stored, with the capacity to handle a 100-year storm event.
  - Two rain gardens were added. Rain gardens are depressed landscape areas that stormwater runoff will be directed towards.
  - The design maximizes ground water recharge.
  - The O&M plan includes source control, spill prevention, and a maintenance program.
- The applicants have met with the Edgartown Water and Sewer Departments, and have submitted plans to Bill Chapman and David Thompson. The sewer has sufficient capacity to accommodate the expansion. The water main would need to be relocated. There would be a new sewer connection for Stop & Shop and the bank.
- Noise Study:
  - A Noise Study was submitted for the rooftop mechanical equipment and the loading activities under the worst case scenarios.
  - Ambient sound levels were measured over a four day period from January 13, 2016 to January 16, 2016. M1 was 41 decibels (dB) during the day and 38 dB at night. M2 was 39 dB per during the day and 34 dB at night. This is not typical for a suburban location, but it created a base level. They identified the receptor locations.
  - The noise model resulted in a sound increase range of 2-23 dB.
  - The applicants propose a mitigation plan that includes a 12 foot sound attenuation wall along the rear of the property, and an 8 foot sound attenuation wall on the roof for the mechanical units. With mitigation, the sound level range increased 1.4 to 9.9 dB. MassDEP threshold is a maximum 10 dB increase.
  - A visual of the wall types were shown. They are made from a composite wood material and manufactured by the Trex Company. There are various styles and colors. The applicants would work with the local community and the neighbors to determine the final look and feel of the wall. The manufacturer specifications indicating the noise specifications have been met and will be submitted for the record.
  - A visual of the walls for the HVAC on the top of the building was shown. The material is aluminum, steel or galvanized steel for noise block.

**Chuck Sullivan** presented the following:

- The proposed rendering was shown to illustrate the architecture of the building.
- The store would be kept open during construction and most of the original massing of the building would be maintained.
- For the new addition, the new entry way would be the more prominent entryway, emphasized with a larger pediment.
- A couple of smaller existing gables would be removed, and the smaller dormers replaced with larger dormers to give more mass to the old building to fit with the new building.
- The roof would be asphalt shingle, the trim painted white and natural cedar shingles for siding. There would be brick veneer along the building for maintenance.
- Elevations of the existing and proposed buildings were shown for the front, rear and left/west side.
- A rendering of the proposed Rockland Trust Bank building was shown.



**Samira Ahmadi** presented the LEED and Energy Analysis:

- Her background is in architecture and building technology, and she has been involved with LEED for ten years.
- The applicant looked at energy sustainability and LEED to try to minimize the environmental footprint.
- The old, existing buildings would be renovated, including the installation of a new HVAC system and lighting fixtures that will make the building energy efficient.
- An energy model was run for the project. It compared the annual energy performance of the building and concluded that the building could reduce energy consumption by 13-15% annually.
- The heat from the refrigeration equipment would be captured and brought into the building.
- All of the lighting would be LED, and would decrease the electricity use for lighting by 10-20%.
- LEED Green Building certification was used as a guideline for energy efficiency.
- The applicants would be meeting the requirements for LEED Version 4.
- A solar PV on the roof of the new addition to the building is proposed. It will not be on the existing structure because the structure cannot support the additional weight of the panels.

**Adam Turner** said the scope of the traffic impact from the project was brought to the LUPC in 2016. The Traffic Study was done in November 2016. Mike Mauro reviewed it and found it was reasonable.

**Randy Hart** presented the following:

- The revised Traffic Study was submitted to the MVC. It was prepared in accordance with the agreed upon scope from the MVC and the Town, and was modified based on preliminary comments by the MVC staff.
- The report conforms to MassDOT and the Institute of Transportation Engineers requirements. It consists of very conservative assumptions based on future traffic.
- Impacts were shown to be relatively minor.
- 13 intersections were included in the assessment. The study area was reviewed:
  - Counts were done on Friday and Saturday in August, weekday from 3:00 p.m. to 6:00 p.m., and Saturday from 10:30 a.m. to 2:30 p.m.
  - Accident records were collected for the locations.
  - The control of the intersection, and pedestrian and bike accommodations were examined as part of the study.
- There are three bus lines that run in front of the site.
- There is extensive pedestrian and bike infrastructure in the location.
- Future considerations include access consolidation and enhancements, with three drives to two, and with the alignment of the west drive to Pinehurst Road. This will hopefully improve internal circulation for pedestrians, cyclists and vehicles.
- The Upper Main Street Roadway Safety Audit (RSA) included the Edgartown Savings Bank drive, Pinehurst Road and the Stop & Shop east and west driveways.
- The RSA team observed areas of concern: pedestrian crossings, signage and sight distances. The applicant needs to improve signage, lighting, crosswalks, and trim the overgrown vegetation.
- Existing access/pedestrian/bike versus the proposed enhancements were reviewed.
- The applicants met with the Director of the VTA, and she suggested that the existing bus stop be shifted away from the crosswalk and the busiest driveway. It was a good idea and the applicants are willing to implement that.
- The existing condition conflict points were shown. There are currently about 35 conflict points. By reconsolidating driveways, it would be reduced to 30 points, and there would be less confusion of where activity would take place.



- The crosswalks and signage would be upgraded, and the VTA westbound stop would be enhanced with a shelter. Parking and circulation would also be enhanced.

### **1.3 Testimony from Public Officials**

**Angie Grant**, Director of the VTA, shared some thoughts and observations. The pedestrian and bike access from town is very weak. Ideally, the path should be on the Stop & Shop side of the road to accommodate the bikes more. She questioned the location of the handicap parking on the side of the building, and suggested the applicant should consider moving it to the front. With regards to the circulation of the lot, the concern is the queue trying to get into the lot versus the queue to leave the lot. There are conflicts with cars coming out. On the layout plan, she questioned the areas showing the circulation of cars and asked if it should be reversed. If it were reversed, it would force a more even distribution of parking on the side of the buildings. Based on the fact that the pharmacy is coming into the site with more employees, the necessary number of parking spaces should not be underestimated. She is a huge proponent for Pea Pod, it is great and should be advertised more. The increased numbers are alarming, and it is not just a Stop & Shop problem, it is an Island problem. Moving the bus stop would allow traffic to flow in and out of the site more easily. The bus stop can accommodate two buses and the applicant plans to build a shelter, which needs to be larger than what has been proposed.

### **1.4 Public Testimony**

**James Abdu** is a neighbor, and stated that the noise study was done in the dead of winter. It should have been done in August during the peak season.

**Jacqueline Scott** is a neighbor behind the loading dock. It will be one of the areas impacted by the increased noise. There are currently problems with the noise and she can't imagine it increasing. The noise study should have been done in the peak season. She would like to know what hours the trucks would be unloading. There are also issues with the lighting. There was an enormous spotlight on at one point. She asked what the limitations were, and said the neighbors need to know what is being done to prevent the noise from the loading and unloading from increasing.

**Greg O'Brien**, a consultant with Stop & Shop, has been working closely with the neighbors. He has been a consultant with Stop & Shop for 25 years, and knows that Stop & Shop wants to work with the neighbors. He submitted 700 signatures in support of the expansion. Brian Nelson and Thomas Gilbert could not attend the hearing, but have submitted letters in support of the project which were submitted.

**Laurence Thomas** is a neighbor on the east side of the parking lot. He has a problem with the fence and debris from the parking lot getting under the fence. It gets rocks and debris from the Stop & Shop side onto his property. He would like the applicants to build a retaining wall to protect his property. He didn't see any sound walls on the southeast side. He provided a video of the property to show what it looks like in the Fall once the vegetation has died.

- **James Vercruysse**, Public Hearing Officer, asked that the video be submitted for the record.
- **Laurence Thomas** said he would do so.

### **1.5 Commissioners' Questions**

**Fred Hancock** said looking at the lighting plan by the new loading dock, there are two single poles with lumination at 14 feet and a fence at 12 feet, so a shorter pole may be in order. **David Taglianetti** said what is deceiving on the plans is that 3 feet of the pole would be underground so the top of the luminaire is 12 feet. **Fred Hancock** noted that often in parking lots, poles are on concrete blocks and that could be a good idea.

**Fred Hancock** asked if the propane tanks are buried. **David Taglianetti** said they are.



**Fred Hancock** asked if there were any other sound attenuation fences being installed. **David Taglianetti** said no.

**Fred Hancock** questioned the width of the parking spaces. **David Taglianetti** said they would provide a certain percentage of spaces at 10 feet wide, and will work with the Town on that.

**Joan Malkin** asked if the loading dock would be covered by a canopy. **David Taglianetti** said trucks would back up to the loading docks as they do today. The canopy is for covering storage.

**Joan Malkin** asked if the current pharmacy is space rented or owned by Stop & Shop. **David Taglianetti** said it is rented.

**Doug Sederholm** said the applicant mentioned an increase in the weekday trips and midday on Saturday. How would that affect the horrific queue on Beach Road and Edgartown-Vineyard Haven Road? **Randy Hart** said the study was done in a highly conservative way, and the peer reviewer felt the same. The study showed a slight change in each location, and if the numbers are realized, the difference would be barely detectible. It is congested now, as is well known, and the differential would be really minor. The traffic comes from different directions. **Doug Sederholm** said the traffic on Upper Main Street is a long term problem, and it is not all a Stop & Shop problem, but it is a regional problem.

**Doug Sederholm** said with regards to the landscaping, there is not a lot of maintenance on the current plantings. Since the applicants are planting a significant amount of new shrubs and trees, he suggested that a maintenance plan would be helpful. **David Taglianetti** said the maintenance plan is part of the landscape plan.

**Doug Sederholm** asked about the expansion plan and how the construction would be done. There is a lot of work to be completed. **David Taglianetti** said the store would be up and running during construction. A similar project was completed on Nantucket. Departments would be condensed in the current store space while the addition is built, and then moved into the addition to renovate what exists. When the Building Permit is filed, there will be a phasing plan for the interior and the exterior. The store will remain open the whole time.

**Doug Sederholm** asked how parking would be impacted by construction. **David Taglianetti** said construction would take place in the off season and be very efficient.

**Doug Sederholm** asked when information would be available regarding the energy efficiency and the possible addition of solar panels to the new roof. **Geoghan Coogan** said hopefully soon. The Stop & Shop team needs to determine if solar panels make sense, and if they do, they will be installed. The expansion will be built to be solar ready, so it could be added later.

**Doug Sederholm** said he was very impressed with the discussion of the new infiltration system, and asked if the two older systems would be used as well. **David Taglianetti** said the store has had ponding issues for some time. The applicants are working with a vendor to pump out the existing systems more frequently.

**Doug Sederholm** said he understood installing a 12 foot high noise attenuation fence, but asked if it would that have an impact on the shade to the neighbors. Has there been any discussion about that with the neighbors? **David Taglianetti** said shade did not come up during the discussions, and that the neighbors were mostly concerned about the noise.

**Katherine Newman** loves the alignment of the driveway with Pinehurst Road, but was concerned about the residents on Pinehurst Road. **Randy Hart** said a police officer could be stationed at that location during the summer season.

**Katherine Newman** said Pea Pod delivery is good for traffic mitigation. **Geoghan Coogan** said Pea Pod only runs seasonally on the Island. The food is from a different source, not from the Edgartown store.



**Lisa Davis** said Pea Pod has to come on the ferry and it has other issues, which is why that service is somewhat limited.

**Trip Barnes** said there was underground storage on the site prior and the applicant should consider adding a basement.

**Richard Toole** asked if a second level was ever considered to reduce the footprint. **David Taglianetti** said there is a small mezzanine space for offices. He was not sure it would be efficient for retail or from an operational standpoint, but it can be looked into. **Geoghan Coogan** said the neighbors in back would not be pleased.

**Richard Toole** asked if everything was being brought up to energy efficiency standards. **Samira Ahmadi** said yes, and they are looking at adding insulation. **Richard Toole** asked if the applicant was aware of the Cape Compact energy incentives. **Samira Ahmadi** said Stop & Shop always works with the energy company.

**Ernie Thomas** asked if a vehicle count was done for Pinehurst Road. It seems in the summer, there may be difficulty getting across Upper Main Street to get into Stop & Shop. **Chuck Sullivan** mentioned the eastern entrance as an alternative.

**Leonard Jason** asked if the applicant would be bringing up rafters to hold the solar panels. **Samira Ahmadi** said no, the solar panels would only be on the addition. The existing building cannot support solar, and it is still being investigated for the new roof.

**Leonard Jason** asked how long the J-1 workers were employed and if they received union wages. **Lisa Davis** said they are employed for three months, and she would have to check on the wages.

**Leonard Jason** said the Edgartown B-II Master Plan talks about bringing back the Elms and the applicants are proposing Crab Apple trees. The elms could be planted on someone else's property.

**James Joyce** said he has heard about the increase in the building size, but what is the difference in retail space in the current store versus the proposed. **Lisa Davis** said the retail space will be 13,150 sf. **David Taglianetti** clarified that the current is 17,647 sf and the increase is 13,150 sf, for a total of 30,797 sf.

**James Joyce** said he had not seen enough information about the bank, the applicants have mostly been presenting the Stop & Shop. There needs to be more information on the bank.

**James Joyce** said that Stop & Shop has said the property is valued at \$13,000,000, but they are only paying \$13,000 in taxes. He asked if it should be more.

**Fred Hancock** said that rotating the bank 180 degrees would help the traffic problem, but puts the least attractive side of the bank facing Main Street. He would also like to know where the AC compressors would be on the building.

**Ben Robinson** said there was no span given for the 2 x 12, and he would like that information. How much of the expanded product selection supports using local Island products. **Geoghan Coogan** said the reality of a bigger store has more opportunity to bring in local products; it does not exist now.

**Richard Toole** asked what it meant that Stop & Shop has so many beds for housing, does Stop & Shop own any houses or how are they paid for? Are there any considerations for housing on site? **Geoghan Coogan** said Stop & Shop rents houses, and does not own them. The employee contributes \$25 per week for housing. There was a discussion about adding a second floor for housing, but that does not fit here right now.

**Richard Toole** said overall, the property does not provide housing. He asked if sidewalks in the parking lot had been added. **David Taglianetti** said sidewalks will be added on the east side.



**Richard Toole** said it might be a good idea to add canopies in the back for shading. He asked that the applicant please discuss how they use and recycle organic waste. **Geoghan Coogan** said Warren West picks up the organic waste and Leslie Platt picks up the proteins. The old breads are picked up by volunteers and distributed to the senior centers.

**Trip Barnes** said there is 13,000 sf that could be used underground. Putting in a basement makes a lot of sense. Was there any discussion about that? **Chuck Sullivan** said there was no discussion about a basement.

**Doug Sederholm** asked if there was a standard size Stop & Shop store, and if there was a way to compare the proposed store to the off-island stores? **Lisa Davis** said the typical Stop & Shop store is 65,000 sf, and the proposed store would be about 40,000 sf. **David Taglianetti** added that some of the newer stores are 80,000-85,000 sf.

**Joan Malkin** asked if employee parking is off-site and would it be within Stop & Shop's power to provide incentives for parking off site. **Lisa Davis** said employee parking is a union issue, but part of the mitigation plan is incentives for employees to use public transit.

**Joan Malkin** said the traffic report states an increase of four additional trips per minute, and asked how that correlated to wait times. **Randy Hart** said the traffic study found an increase of two to four trips per minute, and he can highlight the waiting time for the MVC at the next hearing.

**Joan Malkin** said she agreed with Angie Grant's thought to relocate the handicap parking spaces, especially since the applicant is trying to highlight the west entrance as the main entrance. **David Taglianetti** said there would be four handicap parking spaces at the new main entrance.

**Joan Malkin** asked if the mechanicals on the roof could be seen from the street. **Chuck Sullivan** said no, that there is a change in the roof height and the mechanicals would be on the lower roof.

**Joan Malkin** asked if the fourth roof was relevant to the noise attenuation. **David Taglianetti** said he would ask their engineer.

**Robert Doyle** asked how many of the proposed parking spaces would be used by employees. **Geoghan Coogan** said none are dedicated for employees, and he will ask the store manager if there is any accounting of it.

**Joan Malkin** asked if full-time and part-time employees have the right to park on site. **Geoghan Coogan** said they cannot be prohibited to park on site, and they are not mandated to park off site.

**Christina Brown** said she would like more details and information on providing housing for employees at the next Public Hearing. **Geoghan Coogan** said no employee is hired at Stop & Shop on the Island unless they have housing, or they will be provided with housing.

**Tilma Johnson** from the Edgartown Board of Trade said that Stop & Shop has been keeping them in the loop on the expansion and they have been working closely with Greg O'Brien.

**Adam Turner** asked the Commissioners to submit all of their questions so Stop & Shop can respond at the next Public Hearing, and the traffic analysis will be put on the MVC website shortly.

**James Vercruysse**, Public Hearing Officer, continued the Public Hearing to October 19, 2017.

## **2. NEW BUSINESS**

---

*Commissioners Present: T. Barnes, C. Brown, R. Doyle, J. Goldstein, F. Hancock, L. Jason, J. Joyce, J. Malkin, K. Newman, B. Robinson, D. Sederholm, E. Thomas, R. Toole, J. Vercruysse.*

### **4.1 Executive Director Report**

Adam Turner presented the following:

- He wished everyone a Happy Rosh Hashana.
- MVC Staff has been working on Nitrogen Removal.
- He will meet with the hospital CEO next week to discuss mitigation and what they intend to do regarding Wildflower Court.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

DOCUMENTS REFERRED TO DURING THE MEETING

- Martha's Vineyard Commission DRI# 429-M2 Edgartown Stop & Shop Expansion MVC Staff Report – 2017-09-14
- Email from Doug Ruskin, Dated September 14, 2017, Subject: Stop & Shop Edgartown

  
Chairman

3-29-18  
Date

  
Clerk-Treasurer

4-10-2018  
Date