



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

Land Use Planning Committee

Notes of the Meeting of May 6, 2013

Held in the Stone Building, New York Avenue, Oak Bluffs. 5:30 p.m.

Commissioners Present: Brian Smith (LUPC Chair); Linda Sibley; Camille Rose; Ned Orleans; Trip Barnes; Christina Brown; Jim Miller; and Madeline Fisher.

MVC Staff Present: Paul Foley; Mark London; Bill Veno.

Documents referred to during the meeting:

- MVC Staff Report revised May 3, 2013
- Letter from Mass. Historic Commission (MHC) -15 Cromwell Eligible for Nat. Hist. Reg.
- MVC Staff Analysis of Options for 15 Cromwell Lane
- Color Photos of 15 Cromwell Lane
- VHB Addendum to Stop & Shop Traffic Study
- HDH Peer Review of VHB Traffic Study

1. DRI 89-M3 Stop and Shop Expansion – Continued Pre-Public Hearing Review

Present: William O'Brien (Agent); Geoghan Coogan (Lawyer); Dave Taglianetti (VHB Traffic Consultant); Randy Hart (VHB Traffic Consultant).

Applicant: Stop & Shop Supermarket Co.; Bill O'Brien (Agent – Viceroy Dev. Assoc.)

Proposal: To consolidate three abutting properties downtown resulting in the expansion of the Stop & Shop Supermarket and the removal of all other uses on site. The preliminary proposal is a 28,093 s.f. supermarket with 43 parking spaces.

Location: 18 Water Street (Map 7f Lot 6 -Stop & Shop and Midnight Farm) 0.37 acres; 14 Water Street (Map 7f Lot 8 – Chinese Restaurant) 0.128 acres; 15 Cromwell Lane (Map 7f Lot 7 – 4 Bedroom House) 0.17 acres; Total 0.67 acres.

Purpose: To review the project and the peer review of the traffic study, schedule a site visit, and discuss when the project will be prepared for a public hearing.

Introduction:

- Paul Foley reviewed the documents.
 - The Staff Report had been revised and new information was printed in bold type.
 - There was a letter from the Massachusetts Historic Commission (MHC) which said that it is the opinion of MHC staff that the Caleb Prouty House at 15 Cromwell Lane in Tisbury is "individually eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under criteria A and C at the local level". A National Register nomination would need to more fully establish the role of the various property owners in relation to the history and development of Vineyard Haven. It is surrounded by three other older houses on that side of Main Street that also survived the fire of 1883.
 - There was also a Memo from MVC Executive Director Mark London with an analysis of the options for dealing with the historic house at 15 Cromwell Lane. It can either be preserved in

- situ, preserved and moved to a corner of the current site, be preserved and moved to another site (yet to be determined), or, if all other options are impossible be allowed to be demolished.
- A packet of color photos of the exterior and interior of 15 Cromwell Lane was provided.
 - The traffic consultants for the Stop & Shop (VHB) added an Addendum to the Traffic Study.
 - The MVC traffic consultant, Kerry Pyke of Howard-Stein -Hudson(HDH), submitted the Peer Review of the VHB Traffic Study.
 - Mark London outlined the peer review.
 - There is still a debate over the trip generation numbers. The Applicant used a low Seasonal Adjustment Factor for calculating the number of trips in July based on counts taken in February. The Applicant used 1.66 based on a state average supplied by the former traffic planner at the MVC. The MVC traffic consultant used 1.97. Historically the MVC has used 2.7.
 - There was a concern with the modeling done at Five Corners. VHB used a program called SYNCHRO which was not able to account for the odd geometry of Five Corners. They got a result of "error" before build and "error" after build.
 - They also assigned 100% of the trips coming down State Road to taking a left on Main Street and then a right on Norton and assigned zero trips to taking a left on Water Street. The HDH Peer Review suggested two other computer programs that could model the five corners intersection.
 - The applicant has still not presented how they plan to manage the garage yet.
 - The HDH Peer Review recommended that the exit from the garage onto Water Street be removed.
 - Mark London also noted that the traffic study showed that few people make a left turn out of the Norton Street exit onto Water Street. That area could be used for improved pedestrian amenities.

Presentation:

- Geoghan Coogan noted that he just got the Peer Review on Saturday. He said that Dave Taglianetti and Randy Hart of VHB would like to go over it point by point with Kerry Pyke of HDH.
- Randy Hart of Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB), the traffic consultants, began by saying that they would be willing to eliminate the exit out of the garage onto Water Street.
- Christina Brown said that her concern is that the trip generation numbers do not reflect the major difference in seasonality experienced on the Vineyard. We need to have real numbers when it comes to the trip generation.
- Randy Hart said he got the 1.66 Seasonal Adjustment Factor from Mike Mauro (former MVC Traffic Planner) but agreed that they would look at it. He said the question is what to adjust the seasonal numbers to. They used 1.66 and the Peer Review used 1.97. He said they have used empirical numbers supplied by the state.
- Mark London said that it makes a big difference in terms of review time whether the MVC agrees with the numbers.
- Geoghan Coogan said that the applicant's would prefer to go to the public hearing and start that conversation. With respect to some of the other areas that the peer review recommends further study Geoghan said that they can't ask the town to reroute the streets for them.
- Mark London added that it is the land use that generates the traffic not the amount of parking.
- Christina Brown said she would counter that with her own observations that in Edgartown people often circle the lot looking for a parking space.

- Geoghan Coogan assured the commissioners that the presentation scheduled the following night before the Tisbury Selectmen is informal. The first presentation of the project will be before the MVC.
- Brian Smith asked if they had a plan for the management of the parking garage yet.
- Bill O'Brien said not yet, they will have that at the Public Hearing.
- Brian Smith asked if they had a plan for the house at 15 Cromwell Lane yet.
- Geoghan Coogan said that they are actively looking for alternatives. They understand that people want to keep it but the current plan is to demolish it.
- Mark London said that if all of the items on the list of outstanding issues could be submitted within two weeks the MVC could schedule the public hearing on June 6, 2013.
- Geoghan Coogan said that they could get it done. The only issue is the traffic. He said that they have a few modifications to the plan to present as well.
- Dave Taglianetti of Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc. (VHB), the traffic consultants, said that they plan to eliminate the exit out of the garage onto Water Street. They plan to eliminate the left turn out of Norton onto Water Street which will allow them to have a continuous sidewalk down Norton. He noted that Norton technically ends at Cromwell and that the continuation of it to Water Street is not technically a public street. They will add some landscaping and would consider removing the public bathrooms.
- Brian Smith noted that right now the trucks are all over the place.
- Randy Hart said that in addition to the one big Stop & Shop truck there are 15-20 vendor trucks a day. Right now the big truck stays all day because there is no storage. Hopefully there will be a time when the big truck would leave opening up that space for the smaller trucks. They hope the truck trips will decrease. Christina Brown said it would be better if they said there will be fewer trucks, not hope.
- Randy Hart said that there will be times when the truck dock is open.
- There was a brief discussion about the town bathrooms. In addition to the town bathrooms there are bathrooms at the Steamship Authority and the Police Station. The store has some as well.
- Tony Peake of the Tisbury Planning Board noted that half of the public bathroom is actually a pumping station for the sewer. He added that there is a limit to the hoops the town should go through to accommodate the expansion of a store. He said that the Edgartown Stop & Shop gets 2 large trucks a day in the off-season and 3 large trucks a day in season. They have a host of vendor trucks that come every day (Coke, Pepsi, Frito-Lay, IFP, tobacco, etc...). He said he would be curious to see the truck movements on the site plan.
- Jeff Kristal said that there is a financial implication to the town removing the town bathrooms. Maintaining those bathrooms costs the town about \$20,000 a year.
- Trip Barnes said that the Town always worked hand in hand with the A&P. The big trucks come over on the 6:00 am boat as do many of the smaller vendor trucks. You can study the traffic forever but he doesn't think you will be able to solve Five Corners. There might be something to reversing Union Street. He thinks it's probably a good idea to get rid of the public restrooms. He said he had an idea for where the historic house could be moved.
- Ned Orleans said that whatever we don't know now we will learn at the first public hearing.
- There was a discussion of where to hold the public hearing. Staff was instructed to look into the availability of the Tisbury Senior center for June 6, 2013.
- Camille Rose said that the visibility of the mural will come up. She asked if they have considered the architectural details on Water Street.
- Paul Foley said that this proposal is essentially turning a downtown grocery store into a supermarket.
- The public hearing will be scheduled on June 6, 2013.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:20 pm.