Martha's Vineyard Commission
Land Use Planning Committee
Minutes of the Meeting of February 26, 2007

Held in the Stone Building, New York Avenue, Oak Bluffs. 5:30 P.M.

Commissioners Present: John Breckenridge (Acting Chairman), Mimi Davison, Ned Orleans, Susan Shea, Jim Athearn, and Richard Toole
MVC Staff Present: Mark London, Paul Foley, Christine Flynn, Jim Miller

1. Karakul/Cannada (DRI 601) Pre-Public Hearing Review

Present for the Applicant: Dudley Cannada (Applicant & Architect), Pete Vincent (Agent & Lawyer)

Project Location: 15 North Summer Street, Edgartown Map 20D Lot 342 (0.2 acres)

Proposal: Move or demolish an existing house (single family residence with a separate office) and construct a mixed-use project consisting of three detached two-bedroom cottage units and two detached commercial units with one-bedroom affordable housing apartments on the second floor. The cottages will be sold as condominium units. The existing building will be offered to affordable housing groups but is likely to be demolished due to location. The two proposed mixed-use buildings would have 304 sf of retail each, 610 sf of residential each, and 220 sf of garage each (2,268 sf). The three two-bedroom cottages would have 1,212 sf in Cottage A, 1,290 sf in Cottage B, and 1,352 sf in Cottage C (3,854 sf). Total sf equals (2,268+3854) 6,122

Staff Report

- The project was referred by the Edgartown Zoning Board of Appeals under DRI Checklist triggers: 3.301a; 3.401d; and 3.402.
- The Zoning is B-1 Commercial: The B-1 District is intended to provide a compact pedestrian-oriented environment for a mixture of residential and business uses.
- The proposal needs the following local permits: ZBA Special Permit; Building Permit; Wastewater Commission permission to hook up to the sewer; and approval from the Edgartown Historic Commission.
- Some Key Issues identified thus far revolve around character and intensity of use.
- The property is behind several stores on Main Street and borders on a downtown green space that is owned by the North Water Street Corporation.
- The site plan shows a lot of stone patio and brick paving for the open spaces with some lawn.
- Two of the five residential units are proposed to be affordable (details not known yet).
- Presuming the two affordable units meets our guidelines then they would be sufficient to meet the MVC Affordable Housing Policy. (The recommended affordable housing mitigation for this project without the two units would be $4,183.) Also, the existing building may be donated.
- The project is in the Edgartown Historic District. They have met with the Historic Commission four times. (The applicants clarified that they are done with the Historic Commission and expect a letter from them soon).
• The lot is 0.2 acres or 8,466 square feet. The proposed Total Floor Area is 6,122 sf or about 0.72
  Floor Area Ratio (1.0 is allowed). The lot coverage of the buildings alone is 36.9%.
• For parking, the applicant will have 10 spaces on the property, Edgartown Zoning requires 6
  spaces.
• For traffic:
  - The trip generation for the housing is estimated to be 44 per day.
  - The ITE trip generation for Specialty Retail (814) is 44 per 1000 sf of leasable area. The
    608 sf of retail area would thus generate 27 trip ends daily. This assumes no high-traffic
    generators (fast-food, banks, convenience stores, gas stations, video stores, pharmacies)
  - The total trips thus equal 71, with peak hours of roughly 8 trips.
  - The current residence/medical office could be expected to generate 28 trip ends if it were
    occupied.
  - Thus the net increase in traffic is 43 daily trips, 5 in a peak hour.

Applicant’s Presentation
• Applicant and architect Dudley Cannada, presented the site and design.
• He feels this is the most densely developed part of the downtown. Most of the buildings are two
  and a half to three stories. Many buildings cover most of the lot.
• Most buildings in the area are a mix of residential and commercial.
• Plans call for a maximum height of 25-26 feet. The existing building is a conventional cape set off
  from the street with a garage. He feels the house and style are a little out of place.
• The design of the proposed buildings is influenced by the existence of over 100 backyard cottages
  in the neighborhood. He also looked at typical Edgartown retail forms/establishments. He
  presented a board showing examples of backyard cottages.
• The site has seven large trees. They would be taking down one or two and will be adding 20 trees.
  The neighboring property has a lot of mature large trees. (He presented a landscaping plan)
• The historic preservation review board asked them to present some massing boards with
  axonometric sketches of the proposed streetscape next to photos of the existing.
• He showed a board with elevations of the retail façades, set ten feet off sidewalk.
• The project conforms to zoning.
• The chimneys are brick painted white and the siding is clapboard on the street facades. The
  Historic Commission asked for shingles on the other facades.
• Schofield Barbini and Hoehn is working on a stormwater plan (not ready yet). SBH does not see a
  problem with stormwater.
• They currently can park five cars that back out into the street. This design gives them room to turn
  around in the property and come out straight. The driveway would be lined up with a driveway
  across the street. They are not removing any parking from street.
• The idea is that people will come and park and not drive more. When you have parking issues,
  you do not drive. That is one of the allures of this property.
• Pete Vincent, the local agent and lawyer for the project, said that the Historic Commission would
  be submitting a letter in support. The current owners of the property will submit a letter saying they
  support the application.
• They are requesting a traffic waiver.
• Re: affordable housing. There will be a one-bedroom apartment over each of the two retail units.
  Each affordable apartment will have two sets of stairs. They have not worked out which affordable
  housing program to use for the apartments. The other partner, Kenn Karakul, has been very
involved with Island affordable housing. They may donate the units to an affordable housing entity which can rent it, or they may sell it to a qualifying buyer and have it deed-restricted as such.

Commissioner’s Questions

- A commissioner wanted to know if the town would get credit for the two affordable units.
  - It depends upon how they are sold or rented, at what price, and by whom.
  - They do not know how much the market rate units are going to cost.

- Energy conservation –
  - Mr. Cannada said he would like to put solar panels on the roof but it would not work in the historical district. They will more than exceed the Mass Energy code. They will use 2x6 building construction with insulation blown in. They are going with high standard materials like windows.

- Executive Director Mark London asked if the would contribute an equal amount to a traffic mitigation measure rather than paying for a traffic study, namely $5000. The actual measures could be identified before the public hearing. Peter Vincent said that, though they would prefer an absolute waiver, they agreed to commit to making the contribution for traffic mitigation measures. Staff recommended that this offer be accepted.

Richard Toole made a motion, seconded by Jim Athearn, to accept the staff recommendation to waive the traffic study on the basis of the Applicant’s offer to contribute $5000 for traffic mitigation measures. The motion passed unanimously.

- Jim Athearn added that he thinks that we should look at making all new projects contribute to a mitigation fund.
- A Commissioner wanted to know if there would there be any restrictions on the retail units such as no high traffic generating uses. The applicants agreed to limit these uses and noted that the size of the units (304 sf each) is unlikely to attract a high-traffic generator.
- A Commissioner wanted to know about lighting. The applicant said that they have details on the plan. The lawyer said that the North Water Street Corporation might install historic lights in the open space behind this property.
- A Commissioner wanted to see a plan for what types of building materials they will be using and suggested that they should be green (eco-friendly).
- The applicant thinks the existing house is moveable. The issue will be the power lines. The main house would have to be cut into two, and the doctor’s office may not be worth it. They are required by law in Edgartown to offer the house for donation.
- John Breckenridge, finished by outlining the items that LUPC will want to see at the public hearing:
  - Traffic mitigation offer.
  - Stormwater plan.
  - Letter from the Historic Commission.
  - Affordable housing plan specifics.
  - Energy calculations
  - Materials to be used
  - Retail restrictions
  - Lighting plan
  - A letter from the Edgartown Wastewater Commission specifying the quantity of flow for the project and the EWC approval of that flow.

- A site visit was scheduled for Thursday March 8, 2007 at 8:30 am at 15 North Summer Street. Adjourned 7:07 p.m.