



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

DRI #713 Kelley House Additions and Renovations

MVC Staff Report – 2021-12-3 DRAFT

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 **Owner:** 23 Kelley Street LLC (Brad Guidi and Jason Brown)
- 1.2 **Applicant:** Andrew Kotchen (Workshop/APD)
- 1.3 **Project Location:** 24 Kelley Street (Map 20D, Lot 301); 23 Kelley Street (Map 20D, Lot 298.1); and 51 North Water Street (Map 20D, Lot 300), Edgartown
- 1.4 **Proposal:** Renovations, additions, and other work at the Kelley House Hotel property.
- 1.5 **Zoning:** Business 1 (B1)
- 1.6 **Local Permits:** Demolition Permit, Building permit
- 1.7 **Surrounding Land Uses:** Other residential, commercial, and town uses in the B1 district, including inns and hotels, The Anchors (Edgartown Council on Aging), Chappy Ferry, restaurants, retail, etc.
- 1.8 **Project History:** The Kelley House property includes most of the block between Kelley, Dock, North Water, and Daggett Streets, and consists of the following main buildings on three lots:

Building	Date	Current use	Square feet
Kelley House (1742 building)	1742	Restaurant, employee housing	10,316
Garden House	1972	Hotel and gallery	24,296
Edgar House	1950	Retail	600
1920 Shack	1920	Storage	396
Carriage House	2001	Maintenance	1,233
Wheel House	1985	Bed and breakfast	3,053
Mizzen Top	1860	Bed and breakfast	4,174
Court House	1870	Bed and breakfast	5,279
The Chappy	1890	Bed and breakfast	5,472

Historical info on the Kelley House is forthcoming.

- 1.9 **Project Summary:** The proposals for each main building and other property features are as follows:

Kelley House: Renovation and additions, with the upper floors converted from employee housing to their original use as guestrooms (20 guestrooms rooms total). Existing two- and one-story sections on the eastern part of the building will be replaced with three- and four-story sections, respectively.

Garden House: Gut renovation, reconstructed entry facing Kelley Street, and matching new entry facing north (toward the center of the property), replacement of vinyl siding and plastic/vinyl shutters with wood siding and shutters.

Edgar House: New windows, doors, and siding; new kitchen; removal of an existing outdoor bar. The building will serve the existing Pelican Club.

1920 Shack: Relocation to the norther part of the property, and renovation.

Carriage House: Removal of exterior stairway, and reworking of windows and doors, including replacement of traditional carriage house doors with glass windows and/or sliding doors.

Mizzen Top, Court House, The Chappy, and Wheel House: Interior changes only.

Pool: An existing pool on the southeast part of the site will be removed, and a new slightly larger pool will be constructed along with a mini-spa in the center of the property, just west of the existing Carriage House.

Shed: An existing shed on the northern part of the property near Daggett Street will be expanded and used as a workshop for hotel operations.

Parking: Reduction and reconfiguration of parking spaces.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 DRI Referral:** Edgartown Building Department
- 2.2 DRI Trigger:** 3.1b (New commercial construction totaling more than 3,500 ft²), 8.1a (Demolition of a structure listed in MACRIS – more than 25% of the façade)
- 2.3 LUPC:** Not yet confirmed
- 2.4 Public Hearing:** Not yet scheduled

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

- 3.1 Wastewater:** The applicant has stated that the total wastewater flow for the property, including all buildings, will decrease from 17,101 gallons per day (GPD) to 16,672 GPD. The total number of bedrooms will increase from 81 to 84, while the total restaurant seats open to the public will decrease from 231 to 212, office space will decrease from 965 ft² to 164 ft², and retail space will decrease from 676 ft² to 0 ft².

- 3.2 Stormwater and Drainage:** The total amount of impervious surface on the site will decrease from 32,529 ft² to 32,167 ft². A drainage plan shows two infiltration systems just outside the flood zone, and four bio-retention areas, along with an existing ejector pump east of the Garden House. The satellite parking lot on Winter Street has an existing catch basin that will remain.

Climate Change Resilience: About 75% of the property is within the FEMA velocity flood zone, (the most hazardous flood zone) which indicates an increased risk from wave damage during storms, in addition to flooding. In this case, the velocity zone coincides with the 100-year flood zone. Because of sea-level rise and climate change, 100-year floods are happening with much greater frequency than the 1% annual chance officially assigned to those areas. The FEMA flood maps are also based

on historical data and do not include sea-level rise and the consequent increase in the height of storm surge and the amount of flooding.

Flood risk projections for the area around the Kelley House show that while most of the property currently has a 0-25% annual chance of flooding, that risk will increase to 25-50% for most of the property by 2030, 50-75% by 2050, and more than 75% by 2070.

The applicant plans to seek relief through the MA Architectural Access Board and State Building Code Board of Appeals for requirements related to construction in the floodplain, in part so that the buildings and additions do not have to be raised above the floodplain level. If building code exemptions are not an option, the applicant plans to seek a building code refusal letter in order to seek relief through the Building Code Board of Appeals for the Kelley House building. The applicant also plans to seek similar relief for the Garden House, Carriage House, and 1920 Shack.

The applicant has stated that regardless of the possible exemptions, the Kelley House additions will be constructed with “largely flood-proof materials at grade, and will allow adequate flow for rising floodwaters through flood vents and restrict all guest room occupancies to upper levels constructed above the base flood elevation as required.” The applicant has also stated that “All mechanical, fire protection, and electrical systems will be installed as required above the floodplain elevation or constructed in a floodproof or flood resistant manner where necessary.”

Further details on the desired exemptions and/or refusal letters are provided in the applicant’s response to MVC questions dated Nov. 17, 2021.

- 3.3 Energy:** The applicant has proposed all-electric utilities for the buildings and pool, and at least one electric vehicle charging station. The applicant has stated that onsite renewable energy generation will be impractical due to the limited area and historical context of the site. Off-site energy mitigation as stipulated in the MVC Energy Policy has not been offered.
- 3.4 Traffic and Transportation:** The proposed parking plan consists of (1) a new gravel parking lot on the southeast part of the Kelley House property with 10 spaces, (2) an existing lot on the northern part of the property with 10 spaces that will be shared with the Edgartown COA (including some that extend onto the COA property), and (3) another existing parking lot a short distance away on Winter Street with 14 spaces (34 spaces total). An existing lot in the center of the property will be replaced with the pool area.

The Kelley House and COA have had a longstanding agreement to share the spots that extend onto the COA property, and the applicant has stated that there will be more formal arrangement to allow that use to continue. The COA will also have access to two handicapped spaces on Dock Street near its handicapped ramp.

The Winter Street lot is currently paved, and the pavement will be widened slightly to the north and south. All parking lots will be serviced by a professional valet service for hotel guests.

The parking plan entails a reduction from 45 to 34 spots, which the applicant has stated will be in line with the hotel's efforts in recent years to reduce the number of cars brought by guests. To that end, the hotel currently offers complementary bike rentals (although it will be unable to do so next summer due to supply chain issues associated with COVID), and charges daily for guests who need parking. The applicant has pointed out that its Faraway Nantucket hotel follows the same policy and offers no parking for guests. For the Kelley House, the applicant would also offer a shuttle service for guests to get to common destinations, and possibly for off-site employees. Further information about the hotel's effort to reduce parking needs is available in the applicant's response to staff questions dated Nov. 17, 2021.

- 3.5** **Character and Identity:** Renovations to the historic Kelley House will retain exterior features such as the brick chimney facing North Water Street, first-floor brick exterior facing Kelley Street, the same dormers, and similar windows and doors. The proposed addition will include dormers, new and realigned windows, and first-floor brick exterior to match the existing building. Existing balconies will also be restored, and a picket fence around the property will be removed. The renovated and expanded building will continue to house the Newes of America Restaurant on the first floor, and will have nine guestrooms on the second floor, eight on the third floor, and three guestrooms and a terrace on the fourth floor (20 guestrooms total).

Renovations to the Garden House will include replacing the existing vinyl siding and plastic shutters with wood; renovating the entryway facing Kelley Street to project further toward the street, with two stories of paned windows (including the doors), a steel awning, and painted wood frieze board and pilasters; and create a matching but shallower entryway on the other side of the building facing into the campus. The existing brick chimney will remain. The renovated building will include 11 guest rooms, common spaces, and an office on the first floor; and 14 guest rooms on the second floor (25 guestrooms total).

The existing Edgar House, which currently operates as the Pelican Club, will retain the same general façade facing Kelley Street, with new triple-ganged removable windows and a new door, and new siding and windows elsewhere on the building. The applicant had previously proposed an addition to the rear of the building, where there is an existing outdoor bar, but that has been abandoned.

The Carriage House will be renovated to remove an existing exterior stairway, adjust the number and location of windows, and rework the second-floor balcony posts (the balcony itself will remain). The traditional carriage house doors will be replaced with ganged windows and/or sliding doors. The building will include a fitness center for guests on the first floor and one guestroom on the second floor, and will be situated next to the relocated pool.

The 1920 Shack will be relocated to the northern part of the property and reframed, with new siding, a large window for food service, and readjusted windows and doors throughout. Existing porthole-like windows will be replicated and increased from four to seven. The shack will include a small food prep area, along with showers and bathrooms.

Mizzen Top (three bedrooms), Court House (six bedrooms), The Chappy (six bedrooms), and Wheel House (four bedrooms) which also occupy the site, will have interior changes only.

The Edgartown Historic District Commission has issued Certificates of Appropriateness for the plans related to the Carriage House, Edgar House, Garden House, Kelley House, and 1920 Shack, including the proposed exterior materials.

- 3.6** **Material Usage:** All existing vinyl siding and plastic/vinyl shutters will be replaced with wood. The applicant is also exploring options to replace the existing rubber roof of the Garden House with another material, although the options may be limited by the roof design.

As part of the Edgartown Historic District Commission review, the applicant has agreed to restore or reuse the historic windows at street level, and wherever possible to retain existing wood siding, trim, and decorative elements that are in good condition.

- 3.7** **Economic Development:** The applicant has provided the following information related to current and projected employees:

- *Peak Season: 83 people (F&B employed 48 people / Hotel employed 28 people / 7 Managers). Of these, approximately 22 people received employee housing pre-COVID and 18 post COVID.*
- *Off Season: 31 People (F&B employed 17 people / Hotel employed 10 people / 4 Managers). We do not currently provide any employee housing in the Off Season.*
- *After the renovation, we are projecting that both seasonal and Off Season staff will increase by approximately 10%.*

The total number of bedrooms will increase from 81 to 84, and restaurant seats will increase from 231 to 300, with 88 of those seats reserved for hotel guests. The hotel will operate year-round with limited capacity from January-April, but further details are still pending. The Edgar House will be open from May to October, and the Newes restaurant will continue to operate year-round. Hours of operation have not yet been provided.

- 3.8** **Housing:** The top three floors of the Kelley House, which have 13 bedrooms, have been used as employee housing for some time, although those rooms were originally intended as guestrooms. The 13 rooms have a total occupancy of about 23 people, and the applicant has pointed out there is no common space, and only a kitchenette with basic appliances. As proposed, the project would restore the 13 employee bedrooms to their previous use as guestrooms, and new employee housing with better living conditions would be established offsite. The offsite housing is intended for up to two people per bedroom, and to have a full kitchen, common spaces, laundry facilities, and other amenities. One reason for moving the employee housing offsite and improving the living conditions is to attract more career-oriented employees.

The proposal for offsite housing is to either purchase, lease, or build new housing for 23 employees. However, the Edgartown Building Inspector has stated that the type of employee housing proposed does not currently exist in Edgartown, and would raise zoning issues, so the

applicant has acknowledged that it may need to expand its search to other towns as well. If the housing is not within walking distance of the hotel, the applicant has offered to provide transportation options to employees, such as bus passes, bikes (with locks and helmets), or a hotel shuttle. The applicant has also stated that if offsite housing is not secured by the time the renovated hotel is ready open, it will house its employees onsite until the offsite housing is available, and has agreed to make that a condition of approval.

- 3.9 Accessibility:** The property will be accessible to the public via walking paths between North Water and Dock Streets. The applicant has stated that “The intent of the proposed design is to make the campus a more integrated part of the Edgartown community.”

The applicant plans to seek relief through the MA Architectural Access Board and State Building Code Board of Appeals for requirements related to accessibility in the historic structures.

- 3.10 Lighting and Landscape:** The applicant has not yet submitted a landscape plan, although planting specifications, including the type of plants to be considered, has been provided.

Staff recommends that the landscape plan include the use of native and naturalized plants that have strong root systems and that are wind, salt, and drought tolerant, in order to help filter rain and storm water, and because native and naturalized plants require less water and maintenance.

A lighting plan has not yet been submitted, although plan sets for each building include the location of wall-mounted fixtures.

- 3.11 Construction Management:** Construction is expected to take place between the winter of 2021 and spring of 2023. A construction management plan has been provided, with an additional sequence of events provided in the applicant’s response to staff questions dated Nov. 17, 2021.