

Re: DRI 250-M - 222 Upper Main Street - WRITTEN COMMENT

Joan Malkin <joanmalkin@gmail.com>

Fri 5/14/2021 6:42 PM

To: Douglas Finn <dfinn@edgartown-ma.us>;

Cc: Adam Turner <turner@mvcommission.org>; Alex Elvin <elvin@mvcommission.org>; Mike McCourt <mike@murdicks.com>; William Sullivan <chuck@sullivanassociatesarchitects.com>; Geoghan Coogan <cooganlaw@gmail.com>;

Doug,

Thanks for the continued interest on the part of the Planning Board. I am certain that Alex will include this letter in the record and that the Commissioners will consider it during their deliberation.

It was a delight last night to be able to move so quickly through the hearing. I am sure I express the gratitude of all of the commissioners that the Planning Board was able to give so much thought to this project.

Joan Malkin
10 Tilton Cove Road
Chilmark, MA 02535
646-894-0656

Sent from my iPhone

On May 14, 2021, at 1:49 PM, Douglas Finn <dfinn@edgartown-ma.us> wrote:

Madame Chairman -

First, I'd like to thank you for the very kind reception and comments offered by you, and other Commissioners at last night's meeting. Overall, I felt the meeting was very positive, and that the review of the project went very well.

In response to some of the insights offered by Commissioners, I would like to present some follow-up comments and recommendations:

FRONT LOT LINE FENCE

As you correctly noted, the Planning Board has not yet determined on whether or not to condition a fence to be placed by the applicant along a line roughly parallel to the sidewalk, as a way to more clearly define the front-yard area. **I would ask that the Commission's Decision defer to the Town final authority whether or not to require a fence, and the final design that such fence.**

BOUNDARY TREES

The presence of old growth trees along main street is one of the hallmarks of Edgartown's Main Street. This property has four significant trees running in a line roughly parallel to the sidewalk, about three to four feet due south. The Town is very concerned that existing trees be maintained -- if they are deemed healthy -- or be appropriately placed with mature trees if necessary. To that end, **I respectfully ask that the Commission consider the following conditions for inclusion in your final decision:**

1. Applicant shall commission an evaluation of the four major boundary trees for potential tree loss prior to any landscaping work on site, in order to determine the viability of the subject trees.
2. If the trees are deemed unsafe or of very poor health, they shall be removed, stumps ground or removed, and replaced as follows:

- o Replacement trees shall be of the same genus and species (Acer pseudoplatanus, "Sycamore Maple"); a different genus and species of similar size, character and quality may be used, if approved by the Planning Board and Tree Warden of the Town of Edgartown.
- o Replacement trees shall be a caliper no less than 1/2 of the existing. If an existing tree with a caliper of 12" or larger is to be replaced, applicant may at their option replace with two or more trees with a caliper of 1/4 of the existing, or 4" caliper, whichever is larger.

EXAMPLES

A tree with a caliper of 12" is to be replaced. Applicant may replace with a single tree of 6" caliper, or two trees of 4" caliper.

A tree with a caliper 20" is to be replaced. Applicant may replace with a single tree of 10" caliper, two trees of 5" caliper, or three trees of 4" caliper.

The applicant shall be required to submit an assessment of the four street-side trees, prepared by an arborist; that if the health of any of the trees is deemed to be poor or critical, the applicant shall be required to remove the subject tree, and replace with the same species, at least

Replacement trees shall be placed along the same line as the existing trees, equally spaced.

I will be making this recommendation

LANDSCAPE PLAN

The overall landscape design is still in flux. Edgartown's Beautification Committee has proven its worth in helping to review landscape plans, and provide solid and detailed advice. The Planning Board will likely rely on their experience through its deliberation and decision process. And, unless the applicant is proposing installation of highly invasive plants (something that would never be permitted!), the landscaping plan of this one lot can't reasonably be considered to be of a regional impact. Therefore, **I would respectfully ask that the Commission defer to the Town final authority to review and approve the landscape design, and condition its approval as it sees fit.**

LIGHTING DESIGN

After the comments from last night about the lighting design, I referred the lighting plan and fixtures as proposed to Bricque Garber (Edgartown Historic District Commission administrator). She noted that, while the two "lamp" style fixtures generally adhered to fixture styles common to Edgartown, the LED lighting element would very likely not be permitted in the Historic District, as the light element (a candle, or incandescent lamp in a hurricane globe) is closer to historic precedent. Further, she noted that the lower "post" path lighting would not be approved, nor would the light-fixture-in-a-granite-pillar path light.

I've asked Bricque to put these thoughts onto paper for the Planning Board to consider on the 15th of June (our next public hearing session), and will forward them to the Commission once I receive them. While the property is not in the historic district, the opinions of our HDC will likely carry some weight, and the Planning Board will consider her comments during deliberation.

Given the depth to which the Planning Board will be reviewing this aspect of the proposal, **I would respectfully ask that the Commission defer to the Town final review as to the specifics of the lighting fixtures, specific locations, overall wattage, and use of timers.**

Again, I'm very grateful to the Commission for the reception of our comments, and sincerely appreciate your consideration of these recommendations. I'm happy to attend the LUPC meeting to answer any questions that you may have.

Respectfully,

- Doug.

Douglas Finn, Administrative Assistant
Edgartown Planning Board
70 Main Street, PO Box 5130
Edgartown, MA 02539
508-627-6170
dfinn@edgartown-ma.us

