

Eric E. Dray
Eric Dray Consulting
71 Prentiss Street
Cambridge, MA 02140
508.566.3797 EricEDray@gmail.com

MEMORANDUM

TO: Martha's Vineyard Commission
FROM: Eric Dray, Preservation Consultant
DATE: September 20, 2023
RE: Architectural Peer Review - DRI #718, 7 Arlington Avenue, Oak Bluffs –
Possible Alteration to 2023 Replacement House

Based on a Zoom meeting conducted yesterday with MVC Executive Director Adam Turner, Commissioner Fred Hancock and myself, the following additional alterations were suggested for the 2023 Replacement House to better reflect the historical integrity of the original structure.

For purposes of this analysis, the current form and design of 7 Arlington Avenue will be the basis of historical integrity against which the replacement house is being evaluated.

1. South Elevation Cross-Gable

The original south elevation retains the Queen Anne-style characteristics of varying roof forms with the cross-gable bay in close proximity to the tower (see Figure 1, Photo 1). With the 2023 Replacement House, that cross-gable bay has been moved considerably farther away to the west on the lengthened south elevation (see Figure 1). The MVC expressed concern about the long uninterrupted section of roof visible from East Chop Drive. The complexity of roof forms could be reestablished by either:

- a. Moving the current cross-gable bay on the 2023 Replacement House closer to the tower to recreate that connection between the two elements found with the current house; or
- b. Adding a second cross-gable bay in the same approximate location as the current cross-gable bay.

2. Tower - Size and Shape

I noted in my 8.2.23 Memorandum that the tower had been improved in the 2023 design by narrowing the east/west width, but the north/south width remains broader than the current tower. As a result, the new tower may be too large proportionally. I also noted in my 8.2.23 Memorandum that it is difficult with only elevation drawings to determine whether the new rectangular tower is at variance proportionally with the rest of the 2023 house in a way that differs from the original house. There are two suggestions:

- a. Generate a 3-D perspective view of the current 2023 design to better understand the impact of the rectangular tower. This would provide a better understanding of the tower's impact from the house's most important viewshed - the angled view from East Chop Drive looking northwest (see Photo 1).

- b. If the interior program allows, make the tower square to recreate the shape of the current tower. It might be possible to have a square tower that is dimensionally larger than the current tower given the overall increase in size of the 2023 house.

3. Tower - Design

One of the character-defining features of the modified Expansive Campground architecture of the existing house is the deeply-projecting open roof eaves. That detail appears to be replicated on the main roof(s) of the 2023 design, but is not replicated on the tower roof. Adding that detail to the tower roof would be an easy and impactful improvement to the overall goal of reflecting the historical integrity of the current house.

I would also reiterate from the 8.2.23 Memorandum that the cross-gable bay on the north elevation is more complicated in design than the current cross-gable bays including the introduction of cross-bracing (see Figure 2). An improvement might be introducing another clipped gable roof and removing the cross-bracing, making it compatible with the existing dormer with clipped gable on that elevation.



Figure 1. 03.06.2023, South Elevation, Existing and Proposed (sullivan + associates architects).



Figure 2. 03.06.2023, North Elevation, Existing and Proposed (sullivan + associates architects).



Photo 1. View from East Chop Drive, looking northwest.