



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

LUPC: 10/30/20
Hearing: 11/5/20
Hearing closed: 11/12/20
Hearing reopened: 1/7/21
Hearing: 1/21/21
Hearing closed: 1/21/21

Martha's Vineyard Commission

DRI #697 Hob Knob Inn Expansion

MVC Staff Report 2021-2-10

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 **Applicant:** VIC MV Hotel LLC; Sean Murphy (Agent); Patrick Ahearn (Architect)
- 1.2 **Project Location:** 124 and 128 Upper Main St., Edgartown. Map 20C, Lots 180 and 179, respectively (approx. 0.67 acres).
- 1.3 **Proposal:** To construct an addition to the existing inn (128 Upper Main St.) and expand to a new site (124 Upper Main St.); total number of guest rooms would increase from 17 to 35.
- 1.4 **Zoning:** R-5 Residential
- 1.5 **Local Permits:** ZBA Special Permit; Historic District Certificate of Appropriateness
- 1.6 **Surrounding Land Uses:** R-5 Residential, B-I Business District, B-II Business District; Ashley Inn, the Richard Hotel, Daniel Fisher House
- 1.7 **Proposal:**

128 Upper Main:

- Current use is a 17-room inn with a spa in the basement consisting of a 274 ft² fitness area and three treatment rooms.
- Proposal is to construct an approximately 435 ft² addition to the basement, and a 1,020 ft² addition to the first and second floors to add three guest rooms (one on the 1st floor and two on the 2nd floor). The expanded spa will include a larger fitness area and four additional treatment rooms. A proposed covered porch would have a footprint of about 827 ft². The total increase for the project, not including the porch, would be 1,450 ft².
- Currently there is a small drop-off area on Tilton Way and a parking area at the back of the property with 12 spaces. The proposal reduces parking spaces from 12 to 11, and adds 13 new spaces at 124 Upper Main (see below).

124 Upper Main:

- The site has three existing structures, including a five-bedroom single-family residence (2,650 ft²); an office building with a law office on the 1st floor and one-bedroom apartment above (1,770 ft² total), and a carriage house with a garage on the 1st floor and a one-bedroom apartment above (1,180 ft² total). Seven bedrooms total.
- The proposal includes removal of the office building; a 4,033 ft² addition to the main house; and renovation of the carriage house. Fifteen guest rooms would be added.
- The proposal also includes four rooms and private bathrooms (in addition to the 15 guest rooms) to house up to eight employees, with a maximum of two per room.
- Total living space at 124 Upper Main would increase by 2,461 ft², including the employee rooms.

- Two driveways and parking areas currently exist on Tilton Way. The proposal creates 13 new parking spaces at 124 Upper Main (in addition to the four existing), with a total of 28 spaces on the two lots. Guests are required to make a reservation for parking spaces.

The [latest plans](#), dated Jan. 27, 2021, eliminate the proposed pool and reorganize the nine parking spots at 124 Upper Main. This eliminates the need for double parking and the need for a proposed valet service, and reduces potential noise associated with the pool. The revised plans also add a lawn at the southwest edge of the property, and decrease the total square footage proposed for the Main House at 124 Upper Main by 363 ft².

Change in square footage, rooms, and parking from existing conditions (current plan; change from previous plan shown in red)

	Existing	Proposed	Change
128 Upper Main			
Square feet	13,310	14,760	+1,450
Rooms	17	20	+3
Parking spots	12	11	-1
124 Upper Main			
<i>Main House</i>			
Square feet	2,650	6,683	+4,033 (-368)
Rooms	5	12	+7
Employee rooms	-	4	+4
<i>Carriage House</i>			
Square feet	1,180	1,200	+20
Rooms	1	3	+2
<i>Office Building</i>			
Square feet	1,770	-	-1770
Rooms	1	-	-1
Parking spots	4	9	+5 (+9 for hotel use)
Total for project			
Square feet	18,910	22,643	+3,733 (-368)
Rooms ¹	24	39	+15
Parking spots	16	20	+4 (+8 for hotel use) (+8,

¹Includes proposed employee housing

Hotel space: change from 17 to 35 guest rooms

Planning Issues

- How will the proposed expansion and spa affect wastewater, traffic, and parking?
- Wastewater approval is for 15 additional guest rooms at four employee rooms at 124 Upper Main.
- How will traffic and parking impact the neighborhood?
- Is the affordable housing offer of four rooms for up to eight employees adequate?

Transportation

Once completed, the project will include two driveways on Tilton Way. The existing 12-car parking area on 128 Upper Main will be reduced to 11 spaces, and the spaces at 124 Upper Main will increase from four to nine. (Total of 20 hotel spots, compared to 12 currently). Both lots will include bike racks. Guests will be required to make a reservation for parking spaces.

The current plans eliminate a proposed pool and reorganize the proposed parking spaces at 124 Upper Main. This eliminates the need for double parking and the need for a proposed valet service.

Staff looked at the parking requirements in the R-5 Residential District, the B-I Business District, and the B-II Upper Main Street District for comparison:

- The R-5 District calls for two off-street parking spaces per dwelling unit.
- The B-I District calls for one space for each guest unit, plus one space for every eight guest units or any fraction thereof.
- The B-II District calls for one space per guest unit, plus one space per 12 guest units or any fraction thereof.

The Edgartown Zoning Bylaw parking requirements for this use are unclear. Although the applicant does not meet the parking requirements, the Hob Knob Inn strongly encourages guests not to bring their cars with them during their stay. The Inn also promotes alternative methods of travel by offering bikes to their guests and providing shuttle service to and from the ferry. Guests are required to reserve a parking spot in advance, should they decide to bring their vehicle with them.

Wastewater

- Both properties are connected to Town water.
- 128 Upper Main is currently connected to Town sewer, while 124 has a wastewater line and will be connected as part of the project. 124 currently includes a five-bedroom house with a septic tank. The Town of Edgartown has indicated that it will provide flow to both properties, including four employee bedrooms and 15 guest rooms at 124 Upper Main. Initial estimates indicated a 30% decrease in wastewater nitrogen associated with this project.

Economic Development:

- The project will increase the total number of hotel rooms from 17 to 36, not including the four additional rooms reserved for staff housing. There will be an increase in spa facilities with an enlarged gym area.
- The Hob Knob operates from April 1 to January 1 and does not anticipate expanding its operations as a result of the project.
- The Hob Knob has two full-time, year-round employees with 10–14 seasonal employees.
 - The applicant anticipates one additional year-round employee and 16–20 seasonal employees after the expansion is complete.
- It is anticipated that the expansion will have a minimal impact to municipal services such as police and fire because the project is located in a densely developed residential and commercial

area:

- The renovations to both buildings will meet current building and fire codes.
- Both buildings will be on Town water at the applicant's expense.
- The Hob Knob is connected to Town sewer, while the second building will be connected at the applicant's expense.
- The Hob Knob's FY 2020 assessment is \$3,472,200, with \$11,981 in Property Tax Revenue going to the town that year. The FY 2020 assessment for 124 Upper Main is \$2,783,800, with \$9,850 in Property Tax Revenue going to the Town. The conversion and renovation will increase the value of each property and the amount of tax revenue to the Town.
- The Hob Knob will continue to generate Rooms Tax Revenue at 9.7%: 5.7% to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts and 4% to the Town of Edgartown.
- The proposed renovation and expansion will create a small number of new temporary jobs in the construction and professional service sectors.

Housing:

- DRI Housing Policy section 3A (Non-Residential DRIs) mitigation is as follows:
 - (a) Provide sufficient on-site housing as Affordable or Community Housing to accommodate the housing impact of the project; or
 - (b) Provide the same number of comparable off-site Dwelling Units, or
 - (c) pay to a Housing Entity monetary mitigation calculated per the formula in the policy
- 124 Upper Main currently has a house with five bedrooms, a carriage house with a one-bedroom apartment, and an office building with a one-bedroom apartment. (Total of 7 bedrooms.) One of the apartments has been rented year-round, and the other seasonally.
- The applicant has offered to provide four rooms for employee housing that would allow up to eight employees to live on-site. The four rooms would be located in the basement of the main building at 124 Upper Main and include a common area with kitchen. MVC staff has recommended 3–6 additional employee bedrooms to satisfy the DRI Housing Policy.
- If the applicant opts for monetary mitigation for a Non-Residential addition, it would have to be calculated using the appropriate multiplier, times the square footage of the Health Care/Medical and Retail development types, as well as hotel or inn space. Note: Hotel or Inn was not given an Intensity Code Rating in the Housing Policy.

Energy and sustainability:

The applicant has stated that the buildings at 128 and 124 Upper Main will be have electric heat pumps and comply with the MVC Energy and Environmental Building Policy.

Correspondence:

As of Jan. 20, 2021, the MVC had received 102 letters from the public, including 41 in support of the project and 61 opposed. Common themes among supporters include: benefits to the Town and Island, example of high-quality hospitality business, good maintenance of current property, and addition of value to Edgartown (both financially and aesthetically). Common themes among opponents include: appropriateness for

neighborhood in terms of size and massing of buildings, adequacy of parking and related traffic concerns, noise (especially related to the proposed pool), consistency with Historic District regulations and architecture of surrounding area (three front-facing dormers in particular), loss of green space and vegetation, the presence of dens or sitting rooms in the inn that are not counted as bedrooms, and inadequacy of revised plans to address impacts to the neighborhood.

