



## Martha's Vineyard Commission

### DRI 674 - Santander Historic Roof Tiles

#### MVC Staff Report – 2017-06-01

Note: New information is printed in bold type.

#### 1. DESCRIPTION

---

- 1.1 **Applicant:** Santander Bank; Sean Murphy (Lawyer)
- 1.2 **Project Location:** 75 Main Street, Tisbury, Map 7-D, Lot 7.
- 1.3 **Proposal:** The Applicant removed the historic clay Spanish style roof tiles that had been on the building for over 100 years and replaced them with asphalt tiles.
- 1.4 **Zoning:** B-1 Commercial.
- 1.5 **Surrounding Land Uses:** Downtown businesses.
- 1.6 **Project History:** The bank was built in 1905 by William Barry Owen on the site of the old harness factory. Owen became rich selling gramophones for the Victor Talking Machine Co. The bank was designed by architect J. W. Beals of Boston. It is made of fieldstone in the shape of a Greek cross.
- 1.7 **Project Summary:** The Applicant removed the historic clay Spanish style roof tiles that had been on the building for over 100 years and replaced them with asphalt tiles.
  - They were issued a Building Permit to perform the work. It was only when the historic clay tiles were being removed that citizens became aware and raised the alarm. The citizens alerted the town and the MVC that the action triggers DRI Review under Section 8.2ii of the DRI Checklist. It was then referred to the MVC for Concurrence Review for alteration of an historic building over 100 years old.
  - The Applicant **submitted the Building Permit which says the asphalt tiles cost \$100,935.**
  - **The Applicant submitted estimates that they had received from CP Rankin Inc. dated October 12, 2016. They indicate replacing the historic Spanish style clay tiles on the 4,200 sf roof with:**
    - a similar 13.25" Ludowici Clay Barrel Tiles would cost approximately \$276,260.
    - a similar 13.25" Ludowici Clay Roman Pan Tiles would cost approximately \$388,950.
  - **The materials warranty on the Ludowici Clay Barrel Tiles is 75 years.**
  - **The materials warranty on GAF Asphalt Tiles is 25 years.**
  - **Asphalt tiles cost less in the short term but more in the long term as they have to be replaced several times during the life cycle of clay tiles (See attached rough cost comparison over time).**
  - **Other factors: Clay Spanish tiles last much longer (up to hundreds of years if maintained), cost less to maintain, can lower heating and cooling bills, can lower insurance (flying embers less likely to spread on clay), and increase the resale value of the building, could be eligible for 40% tax break.**
  - **According to the National Park Service Technical Preservation Paper #30 on the Preservation and Repair of Historic Clay Tile roofs "clay tile has one of the longest life expectancies among historic roofing materials – generally about 100 years, and often several hundred." The article goes on to say that "clay roofing tile itself, when installed correctly, requires little or no maintenance...frequently outlasting the building structure."**
  - **The drive through annex in the back was built in 1985 in the same style with clay roof tiles.**
  - Staff suggested to the Applicant that a few additional factors should be considered: The historic clay tiles that previously graced the building had been there for 110 years. The bank may want to consider listing it on the National Historic Register. If the Bank were listed on the Nat. Hist. Register replacing the historic tiles may be eligible for up to 40% reimbursement through Federal and State Historic Tax Credits in addition to the value of the prestige that designation brings.

## 2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

---

- 2.1 **DRI Referral:** The Tisbury Building Inspector referred it on October 18, 2016.
- 2.2 **DRI Trigger:** 8.2ii (Exterior Alt. of a building over 100 years old), Concurrence Review.
- 2.3 **Public Hearing:** A public hearing was determined to be necessary on February 2, 2017. **The MVC conducted a public hearing on May 18, 2017. The written record was left open to June 1, 2017.**

## 3. PLANNING CONCERNS

---

- 3.1 **Some Key Issues**
  - Should the Commission require the bank to reinstall historic style roof tiles similar to the ones that had been on the building?

## 4. CORRESPONDENCE

---

- 4.1 **Town Officials: Ken Barwick (Building Insp.)** has written asking for a Concurrence vote so that there is a fair review with all of the facts available to the public.
- 4.2 **Island Organizations: Carole Berger of the M.V. Historic Preservation Trust Awards** has written urging the Commission to use their powers to restore this significant island landmark.
- 4.3 **Public: Scott Tuttle, Hyung S. Lee and Dana Hodsdon** has written urging a public hearing review. **Since the May 18, 2017 public hearing the following individuals have written urging the MVC to make the bank restore clay tiles similar to the historic style: Alison Shaw; Dan Waters; Greg Palermo; Mary Rentschler and John Fuller; Joyce Dresser; Linsey Lee; Margaret Curtin; Ken MacLean; Max Skjoldebrand; Pam Melrose; Renee Balter; Stephanie Mashek; and V. Jaime Hamlin.**

DRI 674 Santander Bank - Roof Cost Comparison

<b>DRI 674 Santander Bank</b>	<b>Roof Cost Comparison</b>		
Roof Type	<b>13.25" Barrel Clay</b>		<b>Asphalt shingle</b>
Cost Estimate (CP Rankin Inc.)	<b>\$276,260</b>		<b>\$100,935</b>
Material Warranty	<b>75</b>		<b>25</b>
Avg Cost over Period of Warranty	<b>\$3,683.47</b>		<b>\$4,037.40</b>
Loan Period (years)	<b>15</b>		<b>15</b>
Interest Rate	<b>7.50%</b>		<b>7.50%</b>
Monthly Payment w/out Hist Credits	<b>\$2,561.00</b>		<b>\$936.00</b>
Total Payout w/out Historic Tax Credits	<b>\$460,000.00</b>		<b>\$168,000.00</b>
Total Payout w/ 20% Fed Historic Tax Credit *	<b>\$368,000.00</b>		
Total Payout w/ Fed 20% & Max. State Historic Tax 20% *	<b>\$276,000.00</b>		
75 Year cost with Historic credits *	<b>\$276,000.00</b>		<b>\$504,000.00</b>
75 Year cost without Historic credits	<b>\$460,000.00</b>		<b>\$504,000.00</b>
* Rough Estimate does not include cost of National Historic Register Designation			