



Martha's Vineyard Commission

DRI # 429-M2 Edgartown Stop & Shop Expansion MVC Staff Report – 2017-09-14

Note: Staff Report based on plans received July 6 electronically and August 11, 2017 hardcopy.

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 Applicant:** WJG Realty Trust; Stop & Shop is a subsidiary of Ahold USA; Geoghan Coogan, Esq. (Local Attorney); David Taglianetti (VHB - Managing Director of Land Development); Randy Hart (VHB – Principal); Lisa Davis (Project Manager).
- 1.2 Project Location:** 245 Upper Main Street, Edgartown Map 20A Lots 15.11, 15.12, 57.1, 57.2, 57.3, 58, 59, 87.1, and 87.2 (162,017 sf/ 3.72 acres).
- 1.3 Proposal:** The construction of approximately 17,432 sf of additions to the existing 25,259 sf main Stop & Shop Supermarket building plus the demolition and reconstruction of a slightly larger Rockland Trust Bank building and significant site work.
- 1.4 Zoning:** B-II Commercial: Setbacks: Front 20'- 40'(non-conforming); Rear 10'. Proposal does not conform to 20" Open Space requirement and number of bicycle spaces required.
- 1.5 Local Permits:** Special Permit from Planning Board for expansion of a pre-existing non-conforming use; Building Permit. Work in the State Right of Way requires a permit from MassDOT
- 1.6 Surrounding Land Uses:** Commercial in front & sides, next to a hotel, with residential lots behind.
- 1.7 Project History:** On October 19, 1989 The MVC approved with conditions a proposal by The Great Atlantic and Pacific Tea Co., Inc., for a renovation and expansion of the existing A&P Supermarket to increase the floor area by approximately 12,281 square feet from 10,049 square feet for a total of 22,330 sf on 1.7 acres. On June 6, 1996 the MVC approved with conditions a proposal by The Great Atlantic and Pacific Tea Co., Inc. for the construction of a 1,171 sf. addition to the northwest side of the existing A&P supermarket for an open sales area.
- 1.8 Project Summary:** The construction of approximately 17,432 sf of additions to the existing 25,259 sf main Stop & Shop Supermarket building plus the demolition and reconstruction of a slightly larger Rockland Trust Bank building and significant site work.
- The largest addition is a 15,592 sf addition to the north side of the existing store.
 - There would also be an 800 sf addition on the back of the existing loading dock and a 1,040 sf canopy addition attached to that resulting in a 1,840 addition in back.
 - The proposed additions to the grocery store building amount to a total of 17,432 sf, (15,592 + 1,840) an increase of 69 % added on to the existing 25,259 sf tall one-story building for a total building footprint of the main grocery store of 42,691 gsf.
 - The 607 sf Edgartown National Bank building also on the site will be demolished and reconstructed onsite slightly larger at 1,010 sf for an increase of 403 sf.
 - Total existing sf of the footprints of both buildings is 25,896 gsf. The total proposed sf of the footprints of both buildings would be 43,701 sf. An increase of 17,805 or 69%.
 - The existing Edgartown National Bank driveway would be closed, the existing Stop & Shop Driveway (West) would be relocated approximately 65' to the west to align directly with Pinehurst Road, and the existing Stop & Shop Driveway (East) driveway would remain.
 - The existing parking in front with brick pavers will remain with an additional pedestrian cut through and trees replaced. The new parking areas will be constructed of stamped concrete.
 - The impervious surface of the site would increase from approximately 60-65% now to app. 82%.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 **DRI Referral:** Edgartown Planning Board on January 26, 2017.
- 2.2 **DRI Triggers:** 1.2 (Modification); 3.1a (Development of > 3,00 sf); 3.1d (Auxillary Bldg. > 1,000 sf); 3.1L (High traffic generator).
- 2.3 **LUPC:** March 6, 2017; August 21, 2017;
- 2.4 **Site visits:** September 7, 2017
- 2.5 **Public Hearing:** September 14, 2017 at 6:00 pm at the Edgartown Library.

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

3.1 Some Key Issues

- Traffic: Can the road network handle the estimated 48% increase in peak hour peak season trip generation accounted for by this site with the expansion? This equates to approximately 4 (2 in & 2 out) cars per minute more than existing.
- Parking: What is the appropriate amount of parking for this proposal?
- Drainage:
 - The current store has a major drainage problem in front of the store. The store sits at the bottom of a slope with sheet flow from the parking lot overwhelming the existing infiltration basins.
 - The current proposal removes a significant amount of vegetated area at the low point of the site and proposes handling storm water entirely through engineered catch basins.
 - Should the Applicant retain more contiguous open space with which to handle drainage through more natural means?
- Noise: Have the Applicants adequately addressed noise issues?
 - The Applicants have proposed a 12' high sound attenuating fence along the rear of the property and an 8' tall sound attenuating wall on top of the building surrounding the mechanicals on three sides.
 - However, the expansion will cause new noise issues for the residential abutters on the northern side where new loading docks are planned close to the rear of the property bringing the noise of idling trucks and the beeping of backing up close to their houses.
- Housing: Are the Applicants adequately addressing the housing needs associated with their operation and this expansion?
- Sustainability: Have the Applicants adequately addressed issues related to Green Building Design, environmental and energy sustainability?
- Aesthetics: Does the existing building and the expansion fit the character of Upper Main Street?
- Intensity of Use: The proposal includes an increase in building footprint of 69% and significant site work will cover virtually the entire site and the store will now also contain a pharmacy, a florist and other specialty items. Is this too much intensity of use for one location?
- Impact: How will this project impact and potentially benefit the surrounding businesses within the Upper Main Street Business District and the Island?
- Consistency with Plans: Is this project consistent with local or regional plans such as the MVC's Island Plan or Edgartown's Master Plan?
- Construction Schedule: where will all building materials and equipment be stored during construction?
- Construction: How will noise, dust, and traffic be mitigated during the construction process to minimize possible impacts to the surrounding businesses and residents?

3.2 Environment

- **Vegetation:**
 - The site currently has landscaping throughout the parking lot and along the front.
 - The northern corner of the lot, approximately 1/6th to 1/5th of the total area is wooded. The wooded area is mostly Quaking Aspen, Russian Olive and other volunteer successor species that have matured over time.
 - The trees between the parking in the front of the building are various types of oak trees.
 - Many of these trees are suffering from small silted over tree grates that do not allow nutrients to reach the roots. Trees attached to larger planted islands are doing better.
 - Along the front of the property in the Mass DOT right of way a variety of Apple trees sit under the telephone wires. A few have grown to the height of the wires but most are not.
 - A mature landscaped area of Honey Locust and maple surrounding the existing bank are proposed to be removed for parking.
- **Habitat:** This is not an NHESP habitat area.
- **Landscaping:** The Applicant is proposing removing and replacing most of the oak trees in the front parking lot and the apples tress along the State Right of Way.
- The Applicant is proposing to remove the wooded area in the northern section of the site for the addition and new parking area.
- **Open Space:** Currently the proposal contains approximately 18% of “open space” if you count all of the small spaces between built up and paved areas. There are no substantial contiguous areas of permeable surfaces left in the current plan. Edgartown zoning requires a minimum of 20% “Open Space”.
- **Lighting:** The Applicant is proposing extending the current lampposts throughout the site.
- **Noise:** The Applicant has conducted an acoustical study of rooftop mechanical equipment and loading activities. At the time of the study the design was still in progress. The study concludes that the proposal will result in still adhering to the Massachusetts DEP Noise regulation limits of 10 dB(A) above ambient.
 - Modern efficient equipment and an 8’ tall sound attenuating wall on top of the building surrounding the mechanicals on three sides (Upper Main St. side to be open) should lessen the impact of noise from mechanicals.
 - The Applicant has proposed a 12’ high sound attenuating fence along the rear of the property where the existing and proposed loading areas are. The new loading area fence would be 150’ long and the existing loading area fence would be 250’ long. This “fence is intended to minimize noise emanating from truck deliveries and loading bay activities”.
 - The expansion will cause new noise issues for the residential abutters on the northern side where new loading docks are planned close to the rear of the property line bringing the noise of idling trucks and the beeping of backing up close to their houses.
 - Measured existing ambient sound levels were measured at 41 dB(A) daytime north east; 38 dB(A) daytime north west; 38 dB(A) night time northeast; and 34 dB(A) night time north west.
 - Measured Loading Activity Sound Levels (Table 3) were listed as follows: Backup Alarm 71 dB(A); Truck idling 65 dB(A); Truck startup 73 dB(A); and loading/unloading 76 dB(A).
 - Backup alarms, idling trucks, truck starting and loading activities will be heard on the residential side of the existing loading docks and now on the residential side of the new loading docks.

- **Energy/Sustainability:** The Applicant has submitted an Energy and Sustainability Narrative.
- The building will follow the requirements of LEED v4 for Building Design and Construction – Retail program and is designed to meet the Massachusetts Energy Code requirements and to comply with MVC’s Energy and Environmental Policies.
- The narrative indicates that the proposal would achieve the equivalent of LEED Certified status (40-49 points) with 43 points out of a possible 110.
- The project does not include any on site renewable energy. The Applicant submitted a structural study of the existing roof that indicates it is not currently structurally sound for photovoltaic panels. The Applicant said at LUPC that they do not think solar photovoltaic panels on the new roof would be enough to satisfy a cost-benefit analysis and that they could not do solar canopies in the parking lot due to the landscaping.
- **Water Source:** Town Water. Sustainability report indicates water use will be reduced by 37%.
- **Wastewater:** The proposal will be connected to the Edgartown Wastewater Facility.
- **Storm water:**
 - Roof and parking lot storm water runoff are currently directed to infiltration systems with four leaching areas that are cumulatively 7,780 sf and to the wooded North West quadrant of the site.
 - The current store has a major drainage problem in front of the store. The store sits at the bottom of a slope with sheet flow from the parking lot overwhelming the existing infiltration basin directly in front of the store. A large area of runoff is directed to this 1,300 sf infiltration leaching system.
 - The proposal is for roof and parking lot storm water runoff to be directed to 3 of the 4 existing infiltration systems 6,480 sf and to a new large infiltration tank under the new parking area on the north of the site that is 8,700 sf. The new total infiltration leaching areas will be 15,180 sf.
 - The 1,300 sf infiltration system currently experiencing problems will be taken off line and all water from that area and the new developments will be directed to the new 8,700 sf infiltration system under the new parking lot.
 - The current proposal removes a significant amount of permeable surfaces at the low point of the site and proposes handling storm water entirely through engineered catch basins.
 - There will be a significant increase in the impervious surfaces with this proposal. Staff estimates the impervious surface of the site would increase from approximately 60-65% now to approximately 82%.
 - The MVC Water Resource Policy calls for a design goal of handling the 25 year return storm on site.
- **Storm Water Reduction Options:**
 - Staff recommends the applicant consider retaining more contiguous open space on the site with which to handle drainage through more natural means such as vegetated swales and retention areas.

3.3 Transportation:

- **Access:**
 - The site is currently accessed by three curb cuts off of Upper Main Street. A fourth access exists at the east side of the site through a curb cut of the adjacent hotel.

- The existing Edgartown National Bank driveway would be closed, the existing Stop & Shop Driveway (West) would be relocated approximately 65' to the west to align directly with Pinehurst Road, and the existing Stop & Shop Driveway (East) driveway would remain in its current location.
- The proposal reduces total curb cuts on the site from 2 to 3.
- Upper Main Street is a state-owned road.
- The proposal requires a permit from MassDOT for the work proposed.
- The traffic scope did not require review of a turning lane as part of this project.
- **Parking:**
 - The existing site has 161 parking spots including the bank.
 - An average of 101 (62%) parking spots was observed to be occupied during a Friday and Saturday in peak season (August 2015).
 - A maximum of 120 (75%) parking spots were observed to be occupied during a Friday and Saturday in peak season (August 2015).
 - The proposed Site Plan shows 178 proposed parking spots.
 - 178 is an increase of 10.5 % over the existing 161 spots.
 - 178 is an increase of 77 % over the average observed peak season use (101).
 - 178 is an increase of 49 % over the maximum peak season use (120).
 - 178 is 40 % more spots than required by zoning (127).
 - The B-2 District in Edgartown requires 1 parking spot per 350 square feet of gross floor area for a supermarket and 1 parking spot per 250 square feet of gross floor area for a bank.
 - Under zoning this proposal would require 127 parking spots for vehicles.
 - Several of the parking spots in front along Upper Main Street are in MassDOT RoW.
 - Zoning requires 60 bicycle spaces for a development of this scale.
 - Currently there are roughly 15 spaces for bikes.
 - The Applicant is proposing 27 spaces for bikes.
- **Trip Generation:**
 - Roughly 40% of vehicles entering the site approach from either downtown Edgartown or from Edgartown-West Tisbury Road (via Pinehurst) and the remaining 60% approach from Edgartown-Vineyard Haven or Beach Road.
 - Currently Stop & Shop generates 430 trips during August weekday evening peak hour.
 - ITE trip generation rates were applied to the proposal to generate the estimate of 207 additional trips expected to occur during weekday PM peak hour (637 total).
 - The additional 207 peak hour trips would be about a 48% increase in peak hour trips from the existing estimated 430 peak hour trips. The 207 trips are a 13.5 % increase from the existing total 1,537 cars on Upper Main August weekday evening peak hour.
 - Currently 28% of traffic on Upper Main Street enters or exits the Stop & Shop site during the August weekday peak evening hour (4:30-5:30).
 - The total volume on Upper Main Street is estimated to rise from 1,545 to 1,752 with the additional 207 trips during weekday evening peak hour.
 - This result is an additional estimated 101 trips in and 106 trips out during the PM peak hour during the summer.
 - With the proposed expansion Stop & Shop is estimated to account for 37% (637 vehicles out of 1,752) of the total trips on Upper Main Street during the August weekday peak evening hour.

- Turning movement counts were manually recorded during the Friday evening peak period from 3:00 PM to 6:00 PM and the Saturday midday peak period from 10:30 AM to 2:30 PM in August 2015 for most of the study area locations, which represents peak summer conditions. Additional counts were conducted in September 2015 for the intersection of Upper Main Street at Cooke Street, April 2016 for the intersections of Edgartown Road at Pinehurst Road/Robinson Road and Edgartown Road at Chase Road, June 2015 for the intersection of Peases Point Way/Katama Road at South Water Street/Meshacket Road.
- Concurrent with the TMC's, 48-hour automatic traffic recorder (ATR) counts were conducted on Upper Main Street between the Stop & Shop Driveway (West) and Stop & Shop Driveway (East). 2017 Existing Conditions were established by applying a growth rate of 0.5% per year to the traffic counts.
- The Level of Service (LOS) measured by delay in seconds indicates that the overall delays and queues at the study area intersections are at or under capacity, with the exception of Upper Main Street at Pinehurst Road, at the Stop & Shop Driveways, and at Cooke Street.
- **Circulation:**
 - Currently, vehicular entry and circulation experiences varying delays entering and departing the site. Drivers sometimes circle the parking lot in front of the store waiting for a stall to open in closer proximity to the single entrance to the store.
 - Lack of separate pedestrian walkways within the parking lot compounds the slow vehicular circulation within the parking lot.
 - Additional crosswalks are being proposed. Their placement is still being reviewed.
 - Circulation should be improved and circling should be reduced by a second entrance into the store.
 - Two additional loading bays are proposed on the northern side of the store in additions to the existing loading areas on the south that will result in truck entry and exit through both entrances.
- **Sight Lines:**
 - AASHTO standard for sight lines on a road with 25 mph speed limit is 140 feet.
 - The sight lines are 255 feet to the right of the newly proposed western driveway and 285 feet to the left of the eastern driveway that will be preserved, on Upper Main St., with a speed limit of 25 mph.
 - The sight lines are adequate.
- **Crash Data:**
 - A review of the Mass DOT Crash Report for the latest available three year period, 2012-2014, revealed 4 total reported crashes between The Triangle and Curtis Lane along Upper Main Street, none of which were reported as serious.
 - One of the reported accidents occurred at the intersection of Pinehurst Road and Upper Main Street. Detailed information related to the crash was not documented.
- **Mass Transit, Bicycle and Pedestrian:**
 - The Martha's Vineyard Transit Authority (VTA) provides bus service along Upper Main Street with transit Routes 13, 1 and the Park and Ride shuttle in summer months.

- There is a brick sidewalk on the eastern side of Upper Main Street, adequate to accommodate increased pedestrian activity during the summer months, though pedestrians may need to traverse the bus stop if it is shifted between the two proposed driveway entrances.
 - A Shared Use Path (SUP) exists on the western side of Upper Mains St.
- **Probable Impacts:**
 - This review of the proposal, plan, and site indicates that the proposed project could have the following impacts on the existing traffic situation:
- **Traffic Summary:**
 - In terms of overall traffic operations the results of this study indicate that the proposal could increase their peak season peak hour trip generation by 48% and would account for 37% of the total volume on Upper Main Street.
 - Reducing the curb cuts and aligning the entry/exit with Pinehurst Road will reduce conflict points.
 - Two entries to the store should reduce circling trips within the parking lot.
- **Possible Mitigation:**
 1. The Applicants proposed mitigation and incentives have not been finalized yet.
 2. The Applicant should improve pedestrian connections within the site.
 3. The Applicant should consider less parking spaces or permeable overflow parking.
 4. The Applicant should increase the number of bicycle parking spaces available.

3.4 **Affordable Housing**

- According to the MVC Affordable Housing Policy, the recommended monetary mitigation is \$26,670 for a project with 17,835 total square feet (sf of the additions).
- Staff recommend the following:
 - The current provision of year-round and seasonal workforce housing be continued.
 - In anticipation of 25-35 new employees, new workforce housing should also be provided with established mechanisms for monitoring by the DCRHA and reporting to the MVC for the life of the project.
- The applicant has not submitted an Affordable Housing Offer at this time

3.5 **Economic Impact**

- The applicant submitted employment and housing data today, staff is evaluating the information.
- The proposed project is an allowed use within Edgartown's Upper Main Street Business District.
- Stop and Shop currently operates as a year-round business and is open seven days a week. It is not anticipated that the hours of operation will change.
- The applicant has not submitted a final set of numbers outlining a range of year-round and seasonal employees as well as those employees with health or union benefits at this time.
- The potential impacts to municipal services are as follows:
 - Impacts to Police and Fire Services are likely to be minimal since the proposed project is located within a densely developed commercial/residential area.
 - The impact on Fire Services should be positive because all new commercial construction will have fire safety and code compliance.
 - It is not anticipated that there will be any impact to schools.
 - The applicant is tied into town water and sewer at the applicant's expense.

- The proposed project's site FY 2016 Assessed Value is \$13,216,200 and the FY 2016 Property Tax paid to the Town was \$19,460.26. The proposed expansion will generate new property tax revenue to the Town of Edgartown.
- The existing and proposed retail space will generate state sales tax revenue (6.25%) which is applied to all non-food items to the Commonwealth of Massachusetts.
- The development of the proposed project will create a number of new temporary jobs in the construction and professional service sector industries

3.6 Scenic Values

- **Streetscape:** The proposal includes removing and replacing many trees along Upper Main Street that will make the buildings more visible from the street until the trees mature.
- **Building Massing:** The addition is an approximately 70% increase to an already large (25,592 sf) building. The massing is similar to the existing building. A guide to building large buildings on Cape Cod recommends breaking up large buildings to look like several smaller buildings.
- **Architectural Detailing:** The architecture is similar to the existing with some updating.
- **A.D.A. Accessibility:** The building will have to A.D.A. compliant.

3.7 Local Impact/Abutters

- Noise, particularly from the new loading areas, will impact residential abutters.

4. CORRESPONDENCE

4.1 Town Officials:

4.2 Island Organizations:

4.3 **Public:** Doug Ruskin wrote with concerns of increased traffic and how it might be alleviated.