



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,  
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

# Martha's Vineyard Commission

## CR 5-2022 26 Daggett Ave. Demolition

### MVC Staff Report – 2022-9-9

#### 1. DESCRIPTION

---

- 1.1 **Owner/Applicant:** Jamie Atkins
- 1.2 **Project Location:** 26 Daggett Ave. (Map 5, Block K, Lot 7), Tisbury
- 1.3 **Proposal:** Demolition of a house built around 1900
- 1.4 **Zoning:** R10
- 1.5 **Local Permits:** Demolition permit
- 1.6 **Surrounding Land Uses:** Other residential uses in the R10 district and R25 districts
  
- 1.7 **Project History:** The 2,512 ft<sup>2</sup>, two-story, three-bedroom house was built around 1900 and is accessed by a “panhandle” driveway from Daggett Ave. The lot had been part of a larger parcel owned by another family for many years. The property and buildings were deeded by Silas and Priscilla Daggett to Simeon Pinkham in 1904, which suggests the house may be older than 1900, since Silas Daggett died in 1908 at the age of 67. The house was last occupied in 2019.
  
- 1.8 **Project Summary:** The proposal is to demolish the house. The applicant initially planned to restore the house, but has provided the following reasons for demolition:
  - 1. *The Town of Tisbury requires a septic system installation (see Structural Engineering report).*
  - 2. *As noted in the structural report, the sill and fieldstone foundation is sincerely compromised, making it necessary to replace and support the sill regardless of a septic installation. Given the crawl space height and joist configuration, lifting the house would likely result in an uneven lift.*
  - 3. *Interior of the house requires raising the stairwell head height.*

#### 2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

---

- 2.1 **DRI Referral:** Tisbury Building Department, May 20, 2022
- 2.2 **DRI Trigger:** 8.1b (Demolition of house 100+ years old)
- 2.3 **LUPC:** Sept. 12, 2022
- 2.4 **Public Hearing:** To be determined

#### 3. PLANNING CONCERNS

---

##### 3.1 Character and Identity

###### *Historic significance*

Age: The town assessor lists the house as built in 1900, although it may be older.

History/culture: The original owners were Silas and Priscilla Daggett, after whose family the street is named.

Design/construction: The house is modest in appearance and similar in scale to other houses in the area from the same period. The applicant notes that three corners of the house have settled over time, and that the foundations and sills are deteriorating. (See structural report below.)

Historic portion of existing structure: The entire structure is considered historic.

Previous alterations: There is no record of any changes to the footprint and massing of the house. The house has new windows and was weatherized in 2014. The applicant has stated that interior walls appear to have been removed at some time in the past, and the porch has been repaired. Early photographs of the house were not available.

Contribution to streetscape: The house is part of a development pattern on Daggett Ave., where the houses are somewhat older closer to Main Street. The house itself has no frontage on any street but is partly visible from Daggett Ave., Main Street, and Locust Lane. The lot had been part of a larger parcel owned by another family for many years.

Based on the above factors, staff has assigned a score of 11/19, indicating that the house is historically significant.

Structural report by Welch Engineering Services:

#### *Observations*

*On the 12th of July, a site visit was performed to assess the current structural state of the 26 Daggett Ave property. The portion of the house sitting on the full basement foundation did not exhibit any signs of cracking due to settlement. Signs of settlement cracking were observed in the corners of the house that sit on the field stone foundation wall surrounding the crawl space. The depth of the field stone wall footing has been discovered as 8 inches below grade and sitting on native soils, see Photo 10. The cracking was visible on the first and second levels. The first level framing in the crawl space exhibited signs of rot at the field stone wall interface. The rim joist and floor joist showed signs of separation in these locations.*

#### *Recommendations*

*It is understood that a new septic is to be installed adjacent to the house. This will likely require the field stone foundation wall along the perimeter to be replaced during excavation. Given the depth and condition of the wall, it is unlikely that it can function as a retaining wall to hold back the dirt within the crawl space. A new cast-in-place concrete wall footing will be required to support the above grade structure. The replacement of this wall will require temporary bracing of the house structure during concrete placement to support the first-floor joists and walls that support the second level and roof. The observed wood rotting and loss of bearing area at the sill plate provides a problem for the temporary bracing of the structure. Pending replacement of the first level floor joists and rotted portion of wall studs and rim joists, it is not recommended to proceed with the temporary bracing of the structure and excavation for the wall footing.*

## *Conclusion*

*It is in the opinion of Welch Engineering Services LLC, that the structure will not survive the temporary raising and bracing required to construct a code compliant foundation system. The existing building and foundation system should be demolished and replaced in a coordinated effort with the septic system installation.*