



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

C.R. # 4 – 2015 Beach St. Historic Demolition

MVC Staff Report – September 24, 2015

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 Applicant:** Beach Street Properties LLC (Alex Marx); Brooks & Falotico Associates (Architects).
- 1.2 Project Location:** 2 Beach Street, Edgartown Map 29B Lot 84 (0.09 acres)
- 1.3 Proposal:** To demolish a 1,926 sf pre-existing non-conforming house over 100 years old and replace it with a 2,064 sf house.
- 1.4 Zoning:** R-60 Residential; the property lies within the shore zone of the Coastal DCPC. The house is not in the Edgartown Historic District, though it is close. The Historic District lies across the marsh in front of this house.
- 1.5 Local Permits:** Demolition Permit; Building Permit; Planning Board.
- 1.6 Surrounding Land Uses:** Residential.
- 1.7 Project History:** The current owner bought the property in November 2014 and wishes to replace the existing circa 1890 building with a new single-family home and applied for a building permit in June 2015.
- 1.8 Project Summary:** To demolish a 1,926 sf pre-existing non-conforming house over 100 years old and replace it with a 2,064 sf house. According to the Tax Records the existing building was built in 1890.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 DRI Referral:** The project was referred by the Edgartown Planning Board on June 19, 2015 and received at the MVC on July 9, 2015.
- 2.2 DRI Trigger:** 8.2ii (Demolition of Historic Structure over 100 Years Old) a Concurrence Review.
- 2.3 LUPC:** July 24, 2015
- 2.4 Site visits:**
- 2.5 Public Hearing:** To be determined if necessary

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

3.1 Some Key Issues

- How historically significant is the building?
- Does the proposed replacement building create any new impacts?

3.2 Historic Preservation

An analysis of the building by an independent professional has not been carried out. The following is a preliminary assessment by MVC staff.

- **Building History:** The tax records say only that the house was built in 1890. Some in Edgartown doing research on the building believe that it (along with two houses on North Water Street) incorporated materials recycled from a huge ice house that had been located near a fresh water pond further inland than the existing bowling alley on the Vose property (up the road from this house) which was reportedly torn down over 100 years ago. Apparently Henry Hough wrote a book about the ice house which may have further information about this house.

- **Building Description:** The building is typical of simpler Edgartown homes built during the period. It is two stories high, clad in natural shingles with white trim, with a gable roof punctuated with a dormer and octagonal tower in the corner, and with double-hung windows (six-over-six on the ground floor and four-over-four in dormers). A ground-floor porch extends along the whole front.
- **Building Significance:**
 - Age: The building is about 125 years old.
 - History: This has not been analyzed at this point. The only historical information available is the possible link to the ice house.
 - Design: The building is a good, simple, though not exceptional example of home construction in Edgartown from the period.
 - Context: The building is located in a Historic Area identified in the Island Plan, i.e. an area with a high concentration of century-old buildings. The building lies within the area which the Edgartown Historic District Commission is proposing to include in an expansion of the Edgartown Historic District.
 - Integrity: It would appear that the building is intact from its original construction.
- **Public Visibility:** The building is highly visible from a public way in that it directly fronts on Beach Street in downtown Edgartown.
- **Replacement Program:** The proposal is to replace the existing building with a new house that would be within the existing footprint except that a small 48 s.f. section that partially encroaches onto the town right of way would not be rebuilt. There is also a 13' by 7' garage. The new building design and materials are similar to the existing building and would harmonize with the character of the area. The second floor of the building extends over the front porch so the building would be somewhat more imposing on the street.
- **Comments from Other Entities:**
 - The Edgartown Historic District Commission, which also acts as the Edgartown Historical Commission, has recommended that the existing building be preserved.
 - The MVC asked the Massachusetts Historical Commission (MHC) for an opinion about eligibility for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, but hasn't heard back yet.