



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

CR 2-2022 1133 Main St. Demolition

MVC Staff Report – 2022-6-2

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 **Owner:** Brian and Susannah Bristol, trustees
- 1.2 **Applicant:** Gary Maynard, agent
- 1.3 **Project Location:** 1133 Main St. (Map 29, Block B, Lot 12), Tisbury
- 1.4 **Proposal:** Demolition of a house on West Chop built in 1890.
- 1.5 **Zoning:** R50
- 1.6 **Local Permits:** Demolition and building permits, Conservation Commission
- 1.7 **Surrounding Land Uses:** Other residential uses in the R50 district; West Chop Club Historic District

- 1.8 **Project History:** The four-story, 8,537 ft² house was likely built in 1890 by a member of the Hinckley family. It is just outside the West Chop Club Historic District (listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 2007), and characteristic of other homes on West Chop built in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. It has three stories facing the street and four facing a private beach. The house has undergone various alterations, as described below.

- 1.9 **Project Summary:** The proposal is to demolish the house and build a new house in a similar style with a smaller footprint and floor area, and lower height.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 **DRI Referral:** Tisbury Building Commissioner, March 7, 2022
- 2.2 **DRI Trigger:** 8.1B (Demolition of a structure more than 100 years old)
- 2.3 **LUPC:** June 6, 2022
- 2.4 **Public Hearing:** To be determined

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

3.1 Historic Significance

Age: Tisbury assessor data lists the house as built in 1904, although the applicant has stated that it was likely built around 1890.

History/Culture: The house was built during a period of development that began in the 1880s and lasted into the early 1900s and included most of the buildings on West Chop, including the West Chop Club and many summer homes built by its founders. The house is just outside the West Chop Club Historic District, although the district includes a private beach abutting the property.

Design/Construction: The house was likely design-built in 1890 by a member of the Hinckley family and shares characteristics of other Shingle Style homes in the area. The Shingle Style, with

elaborate massing, gable/hip roofs, and wood shingles, was common in resort houses built between the late 1880s and turn of the century. The house sits on original cedar piers which sit on stone footings at or near grade. Tisbury assessor data lists the quality of the house as Good+20, with an assessed value of about \$2.77 million, not including the land.

According to the applicant, the house's wood structural members are undersized and compromised by various work over the years, including the elimination of weight-bearing walls, and the owners have reported that the building sways and shudders in the wind. The building is heated and used year-round, but only partially insulated and the applicant has stated that the framing is not adequate to meet modern insulation standards. The applicant has stated that addressing the foundation and other issues would require lifting and gutting the house, which would undermine the historic integrity of the interior.

Historic Portion of Existing Structure: The original massing and footprint of the house has been retained, with various exterior changes over the years.

Previous Alterations: Exterior changes include new doors, replacement and reconfiguration of windows, addition of porches, railings and staircases, addition of walls on a previously open basement level, and foundation work. The changes are generally in keeping with the style of the original house, and others on West Chop.

Contribution to Streetscape/Community: The house shares characteristics of other Shingle Style homes in the area, including within the West Chop Club Historic District. It is visible from Main Street and Vineyard Sound, and from the historic Big Pier. Other houses in the immediate area are from the same period. (See History/Culture.)