



BOX 1447, OAK BLUFFS, MASSACHUSETTS, 02557, 508-693-3453,
FAX 508-693-7894 INFO@MVCOMMISSION.ORG WWW.MVCOMMISSION.ORG

Martha's Vineyard Commission

CR 10-2021 22 Hatch Road Demolition

MVC Staff Report – 2022-1-22

1. DESCRIPTION

- 1.1 **Owner:** 22 Hatch Road LLC
- 1.2 **Applicant:** David and Lisa Grain; Chris Alley and Gerret Conover (agents)
- 1.3 **Project Location:** 22 Hatch Road (Map 5, Block F, Lot 3), Tisbury (0.68 acres)
- 1.4 **Proposal:** Demolition of a house built in 1900.
- 1.5 **Zoning:** Residential 25 (R25)
- 1.6 **Local Permits:** Building permit, special permit for height exceedance in Coastal District
- 1.7 **Surrounding Land Uses:** Other residential uses in the R25 district

Project History: The existing main house was built in 1900, with several renovations/additions since 1993. The house is not within the town historic district, or listed in the Massachusetts Cultural Resources Information System (MACRIS). The house currently has two stories, six bedrooms, and a gross area of 7,290 ft², and is considered vacant. A 1,326 ft² detached garage was constructed in 2001.

Project Summary: The proposal is to demolish the existing structures and build a new 13,536 ft² five-bedroom house.

2. ADMINISTRATIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 **DRI Referral:** Building and Zoning Department
- 2.2 **DRI Trigger:** 8.1b (Demolition of structure more than 100 years old)
- 2.3 **LUPC:** November 16, 2021; January 24, 2022
- 2.4 **Public Hearing:** To be determined

3. PLANNING CONCERNS

- 3.1 **Character and Identity:** According to town assessor records, the main house is of “conventional” design with a gable/hip roof structure and wood shingles, and the construction materials and craftsmanship are considered excellent. A record of renovations and additions submitted to the MVC shows exterior work having occurred on three sides of the building:
 - 1993: New 1,100 ft² deck on east side of house, and replacement of existing screen porch.
 - 1997: One-story 240 ft² addition with shed roof on the west side of the house to expand the kitchen; remodeling of kitchen space.
 - 2001: Renovations and additions to the south side of house to enlarge three existing rooms.

The house includes a wrap-around porch and angular second-story balcony facing east (toward Vineyard Sound), a second-floor balcony facing west, brick chimneys, and some elements of Greek Revival style, including round tapered columns, and gable roofs with wide trim.

The house is visible from Vineyard Haven Harbor, but is partly obscured by bushes. The southeast portion of the property is within the Coastal District. Although plans for the proposed structure were not provided, the applicant has stated that the proposed ridge will be lower than the existing ridge, but higher than the maximum height allowed in the Coastal District (24 feet for pitched roofs or 13 feet for flat or shed roofs), which will likely require a special permit.

MVC staff has assigned an initial score of 5/13 for the house's historical significance, based on its age, historical and cultural associations, design and construction, location and visibility, and level of town review, indicating it has minimal historical significance.

The Tisbury Historical Commission (THC) was unable to provide input on the building's significance prior to the LUPC meeting on Nov. 16, but planned to have a site review and discussion on Dec. 1, after which it would provide an opinion to the MVC. The LUPC agreed that the project could proceed to the full MVC once the THC opinion was provided. The THC met and discussed the project in December, but has not provided an opinion to the MVC. MVC staff and the applicant made several inquiries with the THC, and it was ultimately decided that the LUPC would need to meet again and determine whether a separate independent review is necessary in lieu of the THC opinion.

- 3.2 Structural Integrity:** The house has undergone several changes since 1993 and is in average condition. A structural evaluation by John Lolley in November 2021 noted significant deterioration of the stone/cement foundation, which has weakened the foundation wall; some bowing of the support timbers in the basement; cupping/bowing of the first-level floors and support timbers due to dampness in the basement; warping of floors on part of the second level; interior doors that don't close properly; and possible mold on the first level. The report concludes: "Overall, the house is in average condition for its age. It is recommended that the structural and dampness issues be addressed if continued to be used as a residence."
- 3.3 Material Use:** The applicant is willing to provide salvaged materials to a non-profit organization prior to demolition, but there are no specific plans to do so. The applicant's agent was unaware of any efforts to relocate or further renovate the house as alternatives to demolition.