

OAK BLUFFS COMMUNITY WORKSHOP #1: SUMMARY OF RESULTS

Prepared by JM Goldson 10/12/16, revised 10/31/16

Summary

The purpose of the first of three community workshops in Oak Bluffs was to introduce participants to the Housing Production Plan (HPP) project scope and schedule, to discuss housing needs in the community and Island-wide, and to develop a preliminary housing vision for the community and the Island.

The following themes emerged as residents considered the current housing environment in Oak Bluffs and ideas for the future of housing in their community: the town is the Island hub, cooperation and collaboration needed to balance needs and resources on the Island, and pride in diversity of the community.

Workshop participants identify Oak Bluffs as the Island hub - home of the Island's hospital, regional high school, much senior housing, and the YMCA. Its services and infrastructure serve both seasonal and year-round residents from across the Island. Through cooperation and collaboration, Oak Bluffs workshop participants want to reach out into the larger Island community to balance the needs and resources of all Island towns and residents more equitably. Participants are proud of the town's diversity and strong sense of community - two characteristics that can be strengthened and shared through thoughtful housing development and resource allocation. Participants envisioned a future for Oak Bluffs where there are multi/intergenerational apartment complexes, more year-round housing, affordable housing, mixed-use, and more innovative housing options.

Workshop Design

The workshop took place in the Oak Bluffs School cafeteria on Wednesday September 21, 2016 from 4-6:30pm. Fifty-four people attended. The purpose of the workshop was to engage Oak Bluffs community members in an interactive process that both informs and solicits ideas.

- Information: A presentation gave participants an introduction to the purpose of a Housing Production Plan, affordability criteria, and indicators of housing need.
- Public input: Working in small groups, participants outlined a housing vision for their town and the Island and also identified opportunities and obstacles in the community and the Island to address housing needs.

Methods

The workshop consisted of a presentation and digital group polling as well as small group discussions and other informal exercises. To start, participants placed a pin on a map of

Martha's Vineyard to show where they live, and then using post-it notes they answered two questions on a word cloud, "Describe a quality you like about Oak Bluffs," and "Describe a quality you like about Martha's Vineyard."

Before the consultants' presentation, participants worked in pairs or threesomes to interview each other about how long they have lived on the Vineyard and housing issues.

Consultants Jennifer Goldson and Judi Barrett described the purpose and process of creating a Housing Production Plan and re-enforced the need for community insight and input into the process. The presentation also included preliminary findings from the recently completed draft Housing Needs Assessment, as well as digital group polling.

After the presentation, participants worked for one hour in small groups of 4-8 on three discussion topics. To start, participants discussed the presentation they heard and considered the information together as a group-- What was a surprise to them? What unanswered questions were they left with? Next, the groups developed a vision of their community and the Island with a range of housing options that satisfy the needs of multiple groups and users. What would that look like? Lastly, groups identified the real-world opportunities and obstacles to achieving this vision. At the close of the workshop, a representative from each table presented some of the ideas their group identified.

Interviews

The interviews consisted of five questions designed to record how long participants have lived on the Vineyard and in this community, and how their housing needs may have changed over that time. In addition, the questions captured participants' ideas about the Island's and their community's housing needs.

Participants indicated they have been living on the Island between eight and 42 years and that they have lived in a variety of housing types on the Island including single-family houses, guest houses, apartment, shed, chicken coop, and tent – most prominent response was single-family house. Participants noted housing issues including affordable year-round housing, NIMBY, housing being planned by people who already have housing, impact of housing on neighborhoods, seasonal workforce housing, and obsolete zoning restrictions.

Digital Group Polling

Group polling enables workshop organizers to get a picture of who participants are and what brought them to the workshop. How long have they lived on the Vineyard? How long have they lived in their current homes? Are they homeowners or renters? Year-round or seasonal?

Lived on the Vineyard

- Forty-seven percent of respondents have lived on the Vineyard for 20 years or more.
- Twenty-four percent have lived in the Island for 10-20 years
- Twenty-six percent have lived on the Island from ten to fewer than five years.

Moved to Current Home

- Fifty-eight percent of respondents moved into their current homes 1990-2009.
- Twenty-six percent of participants moved into their current homes since 2010.

Own/Rent

- Eighty percent of participants own their own homes and live in them year-round.
- Four percent of attendees own their home and live there part-time.
- Seven percent of respondents rent their homes year-round, and two percent live in seasonal rentals.
- Seven percent chose “Other.”

Primary Reason for Attending Workshop

- Thirty-five percent responded that they attended in order to advocate for affordable housing.
- Thirty percent were there to gather information.
- Twenty-two percent to protect community integrity.
- Nine percent to ensure economic vitality
- Four percent “Other.”

Small Group Discussions

Participants worked in groups of four to eight on three discussion topics. To start, groups considered the information they heard in the presentation (Part A). What surprised them? What questions did they have after the presentation? The second discussion topic (Part B) asked participants to formulate a “perfect-world” vision of housing in their community and the Island as a whole. Finally, in Part C, groups considered what real world opportunities and obstacles exist to help or hinder their vision coming to fruition.

Part A – Debriefing

With regard to the presentation, Oak Bluffs workshop participants found the most important housing need is for rental housing and year-round housing and were most surprised to hear the higher percentage of seasonal housing, cost burdened households, and low-moderate income households. Some participants questioned income data – some thought there are likely more low/moderate income households and others thought there are likely less. Some participants hoped that more renters and more young people would participate in the workshop. Participants want to hear more about regionalization, issues of nitrogen loading, tax incentives, and elderly, among other topics.

Part B - Visioning

Oak Bluffs

Most of the discuss groups indicated that the community’s housing stock is poor in meeting the needs of the population – one of which also indicated fair. One table indicated fair. No tables indicated that the community’s housing stock meets needs well. Participants envisioned a

future for Oak Bluffs where there are multi/intergenerational apartment complexes, more year-round rental units and condominiums, affordable housing, mixed-use with commercial on the ground floor and apartments above, more innovative housing options, like co-housing, more building near available services including mixed-use village concept close to amenities. Participants also envisioned larger single-family homes converted to multifamily units, smaller homes, cluster housing, and in general more diversity in all housing types.

Island-wide

The participants also primarily thought that the Island-wide housing stock meets the needs of the population poorly (with one group indicating both poor and fair). Some of the participants envisioned an Island that implements a regional “one-island” solution and consolidates the six towns to one, noting that “we are one big community.” Some participants envisioned an Island that subsidizes Oak Bluffs for shouldering the regional services or more options provided in other towns. Participants noted that they envisioned equal sharing of production of affordable housing to scatter across the Island including up-island towns. Participants envisioned innovated, multigenerational, and environmentally-sensitive design, and a variety of rental options. Participants also envisioned dormitory style housing and more of a year-round base.

Part C - Opportunities and Obstacles

Oak Bluffs

Participants noted many opportunities to realize their housing vision including available land for development, funds available in the housing trust, summer residents who may make donations, and a significant existing housing stock that could be converted to affordable housing. One theme that a number of groups noted aspects of is the strength of the local community in terms of high education, pride, diversity, and engagement. One group noted availability of sewer, but other groups recognized that there are serious wastewater capacity limitations, combined with a fragile environment and ongoing nitrogen issues. Groups also pointed out zoning limitations, NIMBY, limited funding, and development/land costs.

Island-wide

Participants noted that the Island-wide philanthropic community provides an opportunity to tap into to create housing Island-wide. Participants emphasized the need for a regional approach to share costs. Participants pointed out that there is a lack of inter-town cooperation and noted duplication of services regionally, lack of management and centralization, and the difficulty in getting towns to work together on the Island to agree on solutions – a general lack of regional willingness.

APPENDIX I: WELCOMING EXERCISES

MAP

Place a pin on the map of the Island where you live



Most participants indicated that they live in Oak Bluffs – primarily in the northern section of town. One participant lived in Aquinnah and one in Edgartown. In addition, based on responses to the small group discussions Part A (debriefing exercise), one participant lives on the Cape.

WORD CLOUDS

Describe a quality you like about Oak Bluffs

- Location, diversity
- Diversity
- Community and diversity
- Freedom
- Diverse
- Diverse community
- Size
- Parks
- Quality of life
- Community
- Quiet, uncrowded, safe neighborhoods
- East Chop Drive
- Community services/YMCA/high school campus is convenient
- Sense of community among year-round population
- Diversity, history, beaches
- Diversity
- Diversity
- Parks
- Town, parks, bowling alley
- Architectural beauty in historic districts
- Sense of community
- Pleasure to walk/bike around
- Waterfront view road full length of town
- Near resources, recreation friendly
- Community, quiet neighborhood
- Diversity
- Free parking and beaches
- Free parking and beaches
- Clean and serene
- Historic
- Great tourist destination
- Open space, beaches, diversity
- Keeping it real
- Public beaches

Describe a quality you like about Martha's Vineyard

- Respectful of all
- Uniqueness
- Ethnic, culture, racial, economic, age diverse
- Natural beauty
- Safety, beauty preserved, open space!
- Doable
- Peace, quiet
- Traditional and kind

- Ocean is 5 minutes in any direction
- Easy vibe
- Winter, drive-ability
- Best place to be retired
- The beauty of its nature
- Quiet, uncrowded, safe neighborhood
- Freedom and beauty
- Seasonality
- History and beauty
- Diversity
- Tradition
- Diversity
- Beauty
- Seasonality
- Home
- Island beauty
- In it together
- Safe haven with easy access to world
- No traffic 90% of the time
- Outdoor recreation, physically beautiful

APPENDIX II: INTERVIEWS

1. Find a partner
2. Ask you partner the following questions and record their answers.

	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	36 years
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable housing for our children who can't afford to live in the community where they were raised
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	NA
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	42 years, my whole life
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, guest house, apt
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, from rental to ownership
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Housing is being planned by those with housing. The community likes to talk about housing but NIMBY
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	It's an island wide epidemic
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	22/15
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family/rent own
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, family vs single
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	not enough affordable
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	NA
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	5

2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, need larger because of visiting grandchildren
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Impact on local neighborhoods
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Focus /high density in OB
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	37/18
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, guest house
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Ownership to rental after divorce
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable and senior, workforce and low income
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	More demand for it in OB
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	8
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable and senior
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	None
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	16
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	renting to owning
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Seasonal workforce, affordable ownership
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Higher year-round low income population but we don't have a proportionate amount of low

	income housing. We have fewer apartments
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	25 years part-time, 2 full time
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	We need to preserve our diverse community
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Different resources, zoning restrictions and schools and taxes
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	12 years
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Scarcity, affordability, functionally obsolete zoning restrictions
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Spatial configurations and scarcity may vary between towns
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	23
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	More housing seasonal and year-round at many income levels
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Income levels vary. Density issues are different in different towns
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	39
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, shed, guest house, chicken coop, tent

3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Stayed pretty consistent
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Need for year-round rentals, seasonal workforce housing
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	We have a lower average income, lower housing costs, lower income housing falls in OB

APPENDIX III: SMALL GROUP DISCUSSIONS

Working in groups of 4-8, participants discussed the following topics.

PART A: INTRODUCTIONS AND DEBRIEFING (15 MINUTES)

I. What is your name and how long have you lived in the Island? (15 minutes)	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hyung, 13 years • Karen, 6 • Bob, lives on Cape • Bart, 27 years on and off • Ethan, 5 • Larry, 30
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brian, 42 • Abe, 6 • Peter, 5 • Rachel, 6 • Craig, 63 seasonal, 5 full time • Marie, 30
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ewell, 19 • Jason, 22 • EL, 16 • Judi, 36 • Tim, 31 • Steve, 9 • Chris, 35
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Walter, 8 year-round, owned for 42 years • Peter, 39 • Christine, 16 • Warren, 37 • Bob, 2 years full time, owned for 25 years • Mark, 6 months
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peg, 18 years • Julie, 4 • Yvonne, 74 • Jim, 20

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dan, 2 months • Dianna, visitor • Bev, 8 • Ann, 30
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Michael, 24 • Skip, 61 years, 17 full time • Penny, 10 • Peter, 75 • Renee, NA
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10-20 years

2. What was the most important thing you heard about your community's and the Island's housing needs in the presentation tonight?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary need for rental housing • Highest foreclosure, information not accurate. Renter spectrum, age group • Not inaccurate doesn't mean what is wanted
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The people who are making our housing choices have houses, lack of renter involvement • The economic data-income/housing cost ratio • The number of people overburdened/lack of availability • Lack of rental housing • Need for new units to be built for rentals
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shortage-numbers skewed to appear as lower median income • Significant under-reported income/inflated numbers-look poorer than we really are, can't trust the numbers-not accurate • Needs-those people can't afford to be here • Correlation b/w food pantry use and low income, expensive to live here, money used up on housing • Decisions being made by boards without a lot of public input but it's an important issue
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High percentage of low/very low income families • Lack of supply • Shortage of rental housing YR and seasonal • # of families spending 50% of income of housing • Difference in tax rates • Values lower • Tax rates are low state wide
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Seasonal buyers outnumber primary home buyers • the rate of construction of 2nd/investment homes • The number of summer houses that are vacant for most of the year • The number of severely housing cost burdened • Sometimes the problem is that the housing is not there
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • "Not much"-only concerned about OB, not enough information about OB • Too many seasonal rentals and not enough employee housing • Couldn't hear very well • 57% was seasonal housing and 15% not available because it's not accommodating • It's an Island problem, not just OB

Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 60% of OB is seasonal housing • Our statistics are similar to Island-wide • Disproportionate educational costs per tax payer • AH and rental needs
-----------------	---

3. What surprised you most about what you heard in the presentation?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have low-income that don't want to live on Island. Can we have job creation or more than minimum wage • In OB, in 10 houses on a street, only 3 are owner occupied • 40% severely cost burdened • Large % of year-round housing is low/moderate
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The overall lack of awareness by those making the decisions • Proportion of housing only used seasonally • The number of people cost burdened • The median income on OB being the highest-based on MV times insert
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Older population • Foreclosure number • Investment property foreclosed on
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High % of low/very low income • 80% median income numbers • Didn't talk about Vineyard shuffle – 9 month rentals • # of people low income
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How low the threshold is for low-income definition? • The definition of affordable- affordable is a relative term • Surprised by lack of young people in audience • Surprised by the number of year-round homeowners in the audience
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ratio of low income individual and percent they spend on housing • Less need for median income than to those under 80% • no distinction between OB and Island-wide

4. What unanswered questions do you have now?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Why, with all the need, are we not always willing to part of the solution? • How do we take action with meaningful results to support a year-round base? • How do we regionalize the conversation? • How to overcome NIMBY? • How to create housing and bridge the gap between income levels? • How to manage nitrogen loading in year-round neighborhoods?
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Census data dates back further prior to what was shown • Real # of what we need-houses
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Why don't we reach out to the commercial community? • Where do we find funds and land for housing? • Why don't we tax seasonal weekly? • Tax incentive for rentals? • Why don't we have more hotel rooms for vacationers?

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If we build a subdivision, we need affordable rentals? • Are we thinking about 65+ people? Demographics? • A percent of land bank fee should go to affordable housing
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Issues with zoning need to be addressed • What's the quickest thing we can do to solve crisis? • To what extent do we attack the housing problem-should the town take on problem when it can hurt middle income homeowners? • Needs major zoning changes • Problem is when we build the units, how will the town support the households?
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If housing is a regional issue, renegotiation of regional contracts may be required

PART B: DEFINING ISSUES AND VISIONING (25 MINUTES)

Martha's Vineyard communities need a variety of year-round housing options to provide genuine housing choice to residents and to strengthen both the individual communities and the Island as a whole.

I. How well does your community's current housing stock meet the needs of the population? Poor? Fair? Well? Why.	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor/Fair. • No rental stock • OB has more low end housing but not a diverse mix compared to other towns • Need apt complex • Tolerate shuffling • Quality is a problem
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Lack of available year-round housing, lack of diversified housing options
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fair. No multi-unit apartments • Not addressing the need • Kids can't afford to live where they were raised • Losing important people-teachers, nurses, library, etc.
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Lack of affordable sites • Why can't we get airport site? • DCRHA-can't get enough rental/subsidy sites, • year-round housing sells to seasonal people • Many homeowners need to make money seasonally to make mortgage
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Not enough year-round housing • Seasonal rentals create income for the homeowner
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. • Workforce housing • Seems like lots of units-need to make more year-round through tax strategies • Subsidized rental units • Enforcement of weekly rentals being commercial

2. Using perfect-world thinking, imagine that your community had a variety of housing options for a range of incomes, ages, lifestyles, family sizes and needs. What would that be like? What would that look like?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Multi/intergenerational apt complex • Town buys foreclosed houses and turns them into rental • Continuum of rentals, affordable to market rate spread across the Island • 50+ units of all income and mix of condos (3-4), affordable housing, a few single family • Mixed use-commercial below, housing above • Subsidized housing throughout Island, not just OB • Greater use of existing structures • Caps on short term rentals • Tax and penalize-health safety, housing inspections • Permitting, documenting of short term rentals • Yurts • Mixed use village concept close to amenities
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More top of shop housing. Add density where it already exists • Co-op housing • Higher density apts, condos, etc. • Rental units to allow transition to ownership • It's important to respect the aesthetics of our architecture and manage need • Zoning changes to responsibly allow new construction
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Innovative housing models (i.e. co-housing) • Community based-progressive, comprehensive, smart growth, environmentally sensitive • Address cost of living • Build near available services • Preserve character and integrity • Develop w infrastructure we already have
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MVCMA • Tiny houses • more rental apts • Diversity in housing-all types of housing, not being locked into specific types • Increase density • Flexible zoning
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rehab large single family home into multifamily units • Smaller homes on single lots • Cluster housing • Rehabbing for health and safety of the existing homes • Stability for renters-apartments that do not depend on whim of owner • Townhouses and condos • Build-out the properties that are owned by the town
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To provide smaller housing-homes with attached guest houses and apartments • Need to look at zoning for in-law apartment • Multiple home dwelling (2-4 unit) • A townhouse style, side by side duplex • Rentals and more lottery opportunities

Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build a bridge, subsidize travel • Need an Island-wide solution • Land bank contribute to housing rather than preserve “land” • Tax weekly rentals and apply towards housing • Zoning • We need a regional “one Island” solution • Get rid of 6 town governments, become one island • incentivize year-round or winter rentals
-----------------	---

3. How well does the Island’s current housing stock meet the needs of the population? Poor? Fair? Well? Why?	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Lack of availability driving market and conditions and high cost • Town to town disparity in commitment to affordable housing
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor/Fair
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Same as in OB. • Zoning issues • We are one big community
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NA

4. Imagine that the Island had a variety of housing options for a range of incomes, ages, lifestyles, family sizes and needs. What would that be like? What would that look like?	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dormitory style housing • Barracks style housing-modest, flexible, year-round
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Equal sharing of the production of affordable housing • Larger projects, higher density projects on larger parcels • Build a year-round base, less tourism based
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Innovate-community based, multigenerational, environmentally sensitive • Incentivize property owners for the common good
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All people should see this as an Island wide problem • Up Island towns dedicate land and build density • Up Island towns need to change zoning
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Intergenerational living allows for mix of generations • More 4 family units, low density housing • more variety of rental options, townhouses, condos
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment-7800 acres in OB and ¼ is tax free • Like to see use of county land near airport, need to make sure expense is spread out Island wide, not just OB • 2 story garden apartments in Chilmark • Condos for seniors with assisted living options • We need Island wide financial contributions
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scattered affordable cluster housing across Island

5. Describe any differences and similarities from what you saw for your community and for the Island.

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Island wide has more area for village development
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Oak Bluffs shoulders the largest economic burden of regional services All the towns need to subsidize or begin providing better options Oak Bluffs has been exhibiting a very low willingness to support AH in the Island NIMBY is the most common perspective in OB
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> OB-degree of services here, not tax paying
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Don't see a difference except existing zoning and density regs Urban sprawl should spread up Island
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NA
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> We are carrying too many Island financial burdens in OB
Table G:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Scattered affordable cluster housing across the island

PART C: OPPORTUNITIES AND OBSTACLES (20 MINUTES)

We know that it is not easy to address housing issues—especially in a place with such a fragile environment, infrastructure limitations, and common public misconceptions. You know your communities best—what could work and what would never fly. With this in mind...

Using real-world thinking, what are some of the opportunities and obstacles to realizing the perfect-world envisioned in Part B above? Both in your community and Island-wide?

Table A	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demand Informed community Small business increase Documenting, permitting, taxing/fees limiting short-term rental High density leads to higher town revenue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> High cost to developing/purchasing housing Over burdening to infrastructure Waste sewage limitations Bias against apt complex Apathy of gov't enforcement Revenue decrease AH burdens town revenue
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Island-wide 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> High cost to developing/purchasing housing Waste sewage limitations Bias against apt complex

Table B	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Available land Dollars in our housing trust Sewer availability Taxing seasonal rentals Split land bank tax 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> lack of willingness to support larger initiatives Nitrogen Parking in downtown
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shared costs Regional approach 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of regional willingness

Table C	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diverse group of educated people • Turn existing housing stock into AH • Community is asset 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Zoning regs • Fragility of environment • Resources • Not enough people's input
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opportunity to plan Island-wide • Comprehensive Island wide planning to address population needs utilizing strengths of each town • Look at ways of using what exists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No one agrees (RC note: in group?)

Table D	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Using part of land bank fee for housing • Review zoning for greater density • We have an engaged community • Community pride 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funds • Land • NIMBY • wastewater infrastructure • Nitrogen (pond health) • Regionalize wastewater
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regionalization • DCRHA, IHT, Habitat • We need Island wide philanthropic community • Reach out to summer people for capital 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regionalize cost allocation • No mechanism for getting all selectmen Island wide to agree on solutions

Table E	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Taxes to be collected on seasonal rental income • Resident home site land available 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cost prohibitive to build on home site lots because of laws governing construction • 15% of homes are not year-round • 24% of town square footage available for development • Deeding and covenants that are too restrictive to allow for more housing • 57% of our homes are owned by non-voters • Need of funds to renovate high school • 25% of OB is tax free • Inadequate sewage + cost to improve

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Laws-Title V restrictions, seasonal workers take up summer housing
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> VTA system 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sometimes not all towns are working together Lack of inter-town cooperation Tourist economy stymies AH

Table F	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Converting non-productive assets Providing housing Workforce retainment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Duplication of services Inequitable education taxation Zoning-density, scale, and historic Adverse neighborhood impact Infrastructure expense Legislated oversight
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Providing housing Workforce retainment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Duplication of services-lack of regional management and centralization Zoning Infrastructure expense

Table G	Opportunities	Obstacles
Note – some members of Table G had to before this question leave – the remaining members joined other groups.		

Bonus question: Can you think of any realistic/feasible ways to overcome any of the obstacles your group identifies?

- Public outreach, cooperation, and a need to work regionally
- Building large projects to attract state/federal dollars
- Promote a year-round community instead of seasonal
- Get people to meet their community to let people meet and understand it's our friends and family who are in need of housing
- Appropriately larger scaled projects, what is "larger"?